



Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales

Cofnod y Trafodion The Record of Proceedings

[Y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chyfathrebu](#)

[The Culture, Welsh Language and
Communications Committee](#)

26/10/2017

[Agenda'r Cyfarfod](#)
[Meeting Agenda](#)

[Trawsgrifiadau'r Pwyllgor](#)
[Committee Transcripts](#)

Cynnwys Contents

- 4 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest
- 5 Craffu Cyffredinol: Comisiynydd y Gymraeg—Adroddiad Blynyddol
General Scrutiny: Welsh Language Commissioner—Annual Report
- 50 Craffu Cyffredinol: Comisiynydd y Gymraeg—Adroddiad Sicrwydd
General Scrutiny: Welsh Language Commissioner—Assurance Report
- 81 Papurau i'w Nodi
Papers to Note
- 82 Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd
o'r Cyfarfod
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public
from the Meeting

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd. Lle y mae cyfranwyr wedi darparu cywiriadau i'w tystiolaeth, nodir y rheini yn y trawsgrifiad.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included. Where contributors have supplied corrections to their evidence, these are noted in the transcript.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Hannah Blythyn Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour
Dawn Bowden Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour
Suzy Davies Bywgraffiad Biography	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Sian Gwenllian Bywgraffiad Biography	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Neil Hamilton Bywgraffiad Biography	UKIP Cymru UKIP Wales
Bethan Jenkins Bywgraffiad Biography	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Jeremy Miles Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour
Lee Waters Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Guto Dafydd	Uwch Swyddog Cydymffurfio, Swyddfa Comisiynydd y Gymraeg Senior Compliance Officer, Welsh Language Commissioner's Office
Meri Huws	Comisiynydd y Gymraeg Welsh Language Commissioner
Gwenith Price	Cyfarwyddwr Strategol, Swyddfa Comisiynydd y Gymraeg Strategic Director, Welsh Language Commissioner's

Office

Dyfan Sion Cyfarwyddwr Strategol, Swyddfa Comisiynydd y
Gymraeg
Strategic Director, Welsh Language Commissioner's
Office

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Osian Bowyer Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil
Research Service

Steve George Clerc
Clerk

Lowri Harries Dirprwy Glerc
Deputy Clerk

Manon Huws Cynghorydd Cyfreithiol
Legal Adviser

Adam Vaughan Ail Glerc
Second Clerk

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:32.

The meeting began at 09:32.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest

[1] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch, a **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you, and chroeso i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y welcome to the Culture, Welsh Gymraeg a Chyfathrebu. Eitem 1, Language and Communications cyflwyniad, ymddiheuriadau, Committee. Item 1, introductions, dirprwyon a datgan buddiannau. A apologies, substitutions and oes gan unrhyw un rhywbeth i'w declarations of interest. Does any ddatgan yma heddiw o ran buddiant? Member have any declarations of Na. Mae Dawn Bowden wedi dweud ei interest today? No. Dawn Bowden has bod hi'n mynd i fod yn hwyr, ond nid said that she's going to be late, but oes unrhyw ymddiheuriadau eraill. there are no other apologies. Excuse

Sori am y llais.

my voice.

[2] Having a Theresa May moment again. [*Laughter.*]

[3] Croeso i Siân Gwenllian i'r pwyllgor sydd yn cymryd lle Dai Lloyd. Hoffwn i hefyd roi ar y record diolch i Dai Lloyd am ei waith ar y pwyllgor yma. Ond diolch hefyd i Siân nawr sydd yn ymuno â ni.

Welcome, Siân Gwenllian, to the committee, who's taking Dai Lloyd's place. I would also like to place on the record my thanks to Dai Lloyd for his work on this committee, and thank you also to Siân, who is now joining us.

Craffu Cyffredinol: Comisiynydd y Gymraeg—Adroddiad Blynyddol **General Scrutiny: Welsh Language Commissioner—Annual Report**

[4] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rydym yn symud ymlaen yn awr at eitem 2, sef gwaith craffu cyffredinol ar Gomisiynydd y Gymraeg a'i hadroddiad blynyddol. Croeso i Meri Huws, sef Comisiynydd y Gymraeg, ac hefyd i Dyfan Sion, cyfarwyddwr strategol. Mae yna gyfres o gwestiynau—rydych chi wedi bod yma o'r blaen—ar themâu gwahanol, ac felly, os yw'n iawn gyda chi, byddwn ni'n gofyn cwestiynau gan Aelodau, yn hynny o beth. Lle roeddwn i eisiau cychwyn, yn y lle cyntaf yn fras, yn amlwg, yw eich barn chi ar a yw'n amserol i adolygu a newid Mesur y Gymraeg (Cymru) 2011 ac i ddeall pa newidiadau deddfwriaethol y byddech chi'n hoffi eu gweld petaech chi'n meddwl bod angen newid hwnnw. Beth yw'ch barn chi ar hynny?

Bethan Jenkins: We move on to item 2, namely the general scrutiny of the Welsh Language Commissioner and the annual report. Welcome to Meri Huws, the Welsh Language Commissioner, and also to Dyfan Sion, strategic director. There are a series of questions—you have been here before—on different themes, so if it's okay with you, we'll ask questions from Members. So, I wanted to start, in the first place, generally, by asking you for your view on whether it's timely to review and change the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011 and to understand what legislative changes you would like to see, if you thought there was a need for change. What are your views?

[5] **Ms Huws:** Iawn. Diolch yn fawr, a gadewch inni ddechrau, felly, gyda'r Papur Gwyn a gafodd ei

Ms Huws: Okay. Thank you very much, and let us start with the White Paper published over the summer.

gyhoeddi dros yr haf. Un peth liciwn i ddweud, mae yna nifer o egwyddorion liciwn i rannu gyda chi, wrth ein bod ni'n edrych ar y Papur Gwyn, ac rydw i'n credu mai'r peth cyntaf inni ddweud yw mai'n ddyddiau cynnar iawn o ran gweithredu Mesur y Gymraeg (Cymru) 2011—prin chwe blynedd oddi ar sefydlu swyddfa'r comisiynydd a gweithredu'r ddeddfwriaeth. Felly, mae'n rhaid inni fod yn ofalus wrth wneud penderfyniadau ynglŷn â newidiadau sylfaenol heb sicrhau bod y dystiolaeth yna efallai yn ei chyfanrwydd gyda ni ar hyn o bryd. Felly, dyna'r sylw cyntaf, bod angen inni fod yn ofalus ac ystyried pa mor gynnar yw hi o ran Mesur y Gymraeg.

One thing I would like to say, there are a number of principles I'd like to share with you as we look at that White Paper, and I think the first thing that I need to say is that it's very early days in terms of implementing the Welsh Language Measure (Wales) 2011—barely six years since the establishment of the commissioner's office and the implementation of the legislation. So, we need to be guarded in making fundamental changes without ensuring that that evidence is in place. So, that's the first comment I would make, is that we do need to be guarded, given how early it is in terms of the story of the Welsh language Measure.

[6] Yr ail beth sydd yn hollbwysig i fi, ac i ni, rydw i'n credu, yw, os ydym yn mynd i newid y ddeddfwriaeth, ac mi rydw i wedi dweud yn y gorffennol, mae yna elfennau o'r ddeddfwriaeth sydd yn fiwrocataidd, sy'n glogyrnaidd, sydd yn cael eu rheoli gan broses yn hytrach nag allbwn. Os oes modd i ni ystwytho rhywfaint ar yr elfennau hynny, buaswn i'n croesawu hynny, ond i wneud hynny mor llyfn â phosib. Rŷm ni'n dechrau gweld sefydliadau a'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru yn gweld cynnydd o ran y Gymraeg. Mae hwnnw'n braf i weld. Mae tystiolaeth gadarn gyda ni—byddwn ni'n edrych ar yr adroddiad sicrwydd nes ymlaen y bore yma—ac rŷm ni'n dechrau gweld newid. Mae'n rhaid i ni gynnal y momentwm yna. Pe

And the second crucially important thing for me, and for us, I think, is that if we are to change the legislation, and I have stated in the past that there are elements of the legislation that are bureaucratic and burdensome, and are process driven rather than output driven. Now, if we can relax some of those elements, I would welcome that, but we need to do that as smoothly as possible. We are starting to see organisations and the public in Wales seeing progress in terms of the use of the Welsh language. That's good to see. There is robust evidence—we will look at the assurance report later this morning—and we are starting to see change. We must maintain that momentum. If there is any fundamental structural change, there

buasai unrhyw newid sylfaenol, strwythurol, mae yna berig y buasem ni'n gweld arafu ar y broses, ansicrwydd ymysg sefydliadau, ansicrwydd ymysg y cyhoedd ynglŷn â beth sy'n digwydd—so, unrhyw newidiadau, mor llyfn â phosib i gynnal y momentwm.

is a risk that we would see that process slowing down, we would see uncertainty among organisations and the public in terms of what's happening. So, any changes have to be done as smoothly as possible in order to maintain the momentum.

[7] **Bethan Jenkins:** Pa drafodaethau ydych chi wedi cael gyda'r Gweinidog? Rydych chi'n sôn am y ffaith efallai ei fod yn gynnar. Pa drafodaethau ydych chi wedi eu cael gyda'r Gweinidog i ddweud y pethau hyn wrtho fe?

Bethan Jenkins: What discussions have you had with the Minister? You talk about the fact that perhaps it's early days. What discussions have you had with the Minister to say these things to him?

[8] **Ms Huws:** Rydw i'n credu, o ran trafod gyda'r Gweinidog, mae'n ddyddiau cynnar. Mi gawsom ni gyfarfod gyda'r Gweinidog ddoe—cyfarfod chwarterol arferol—ac mi fyddwn ni, wrth gwrs, yn ymateb yn llawn i'r Papur Gwyn. Fe fydd ein hymateb ysgrifenedig ni'n mynd i mewn wythnos nesaf. Rydw i'n hapus iawn i roi blas i chi o'r hyn y byddwn yn ei ddweud yn yr ymateb yna—y penawdau, y prif benawdau. Bydd yn ateb llawn iawn. Ond, fel y dywedais i, mi fyddwn ni'n dechrau gyda'r angen yma i gryfhau ac i fireinio, yn hytrach na newidiadau sylfaenol strwythurol, cyfansoddiadol.

Ms Huws: In terms of discussions with the Minister, it's early days. We had a meeting with the Minister yesterday—the usual quarterly meeting—and we will be responding in full to the White Paper. Our written response will be submitted next week. I'm more than happy to give you a flavour of what we will say in that response—the main headings. It'll be a very comprehensive response. But, as I said, we will begin with this need to strengthen and to enhance rather than making fundamental structural, constitutional changes.

[9] Prif benawdau, o ran y newid: fel sefydliad, rŷm ni yn credu bod modd rhoi cyfrifoldebau rheoleiddio, hybu a hyrwyddo o fewn yr un gyfundrefn, o fewn yr un sefydliad. Y manteision o wneud hynny, i'r

The main headings in terms of change: as an institution, we do believe that it's possible to place regulatory and promotion responsibilities within the same organisation. The benefits of doing

cyhoedd ac i'r sefydliad, yw: un man sydd ganddyn nhw i droi ato, yn hytrach na gorfod penderfynu, 'At bwy rydw i'n troi heddiw gyda'r cwestiwn yma?' Gwerth am arian: buaswn i'n dweud ei fod yn haws rhedeg un sefydliad yn hytrach na dau. A hefyd, i'r dinesydd, yn ogystal â'r sefydliadau, buaswn i'n dweud bod yna eglurder. Mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud, i'r cyhoedd mae cael sefydliad Comisiynydd y Gymraeg—rŷm ni'n cael y cwestiynau rhyfeddaf oddi wrth bobl o lot o wahanol gefndiroedd, ond maen nhw'n ei weld e fel man i droi, oherwydd ei fod yn dweud 'comisiynydd' a'r 'Gymraeg'.

that, for the public and for the institution, are that there is one port of all, rather than having to decide, 'Well, who do I go to today with this particular question?' There's also an issue of value for money. I would say that it's easier to run one organisation rather than two. Also, for the citizen, as well as the organisations involved, I think it does provide clarity. I have to say that, for the public, having a Welsh Language Commissioner's office—we receive the most incredible questions from people from all sorts of different backgrounds, but they do see it as a place where they can turn, because it does say 'Welsh language' and 'commissioner' and that's clear to them.

[10] O ran, wedyn, y cwestiynau sy'n codi ynglŷn â rheoleiddio a hybu a hyrwyddo o fewn yr un sefydliad, wel, ar sail profiad pum mlynedd, rŷm ni'n gwneud hynny i ryw raddau'n barod, ac mae yna faterion i'w hystyried, ond mae modd gwneud gyda'r llywodraethiant priodol. So, felly, o ymateb i'r Papur Gwyn, mi fyddwn ni'n dweud ein bod ni yn ffafrio un sefydliad—hybu a hyrwyddo a rheoleiddio. O wneud hynny, rŷm ni, wrth gwrs, yn ystyried y bydd angen edrych ar lywodraethiant y corff yna i sicrhau, yn benodol, bod arian cyhoeddus yn cael ei rannu mewn ffordd sydd yn dryloyw ac yn deg.

Now, in terms of the questions arising on regulation and promotion within the same organisation, well, on the basis of five years' experience, we do that to a certain extent already and there are issues to be considered, but it can be achieved with appropriate governance. So, in responding to the White Paper, we will be saying that we favour a single institution with responsibility for promotion and regulation. Now, in doing that, we, of course, do believe that we will need to look at the governance of that body in order to ensure, specifically, that public funds are used in a transparent and fair manner.

[11] Felly, o edrych ar y modelau o

So, in looking at the governance

lywodraethiant sy'n cael eu cynnig o fewn y Papur Gwyn, mi fuaswn i'n ffafrio comisiynydd a bwrdd. Pam comisiynydd a bwrdd? Wel, cawn ni fynd nôl at yr egwyddor sylfaenol yna o leihau'r newid gweladwy i'r cyhoedd. Hynny yw, datblygu sefydliad y comisiynydd buasai fe trwy ddod â bwrdd—ac mae yna lot o waith trafod, rwy'n credu, ynglŷn â pha fath o fwrdd, ond yr elfen craffu mewnol yna i sicrhau bod arian, yn benodol—grantiau—yn cael eu dosbarthu mewn ffordd briodol. So, mi fuaswn i'n ffafrio'r model comisiynydd, bwrdd, un sefydliad. Eto, rydw i'n credu bod yna ddadleuon gwerth am arian o redeg un sefydliad, un bwrdd, yn hytrach na nifer o fyrddau.

models proposed within the White Paper, I would favour a commissioner and a board. Why a commissioner and a board? Well, let's go back to that fundamental principle of minimising the visible change for the public. So, we would be developing the commissioner's office by bringing in a board—and I think there's a great deal of discussion to be had about the make-up and the kind of board that you would have, but you would need that internal scrutiny to ensure that funding and grants are distributed in an appropriate way. So, I would favour the commissioner and board model all within one organisation. Again, I think there are value-for-money arguments in terms of running one body and one board rather than a number of different boards.

[12] Materion eraill sydd yn y Papur Gwyn—. Mae yna lot fawr o faterion, ond jest i roi blas i chi o rai o'r pethau y byddwn ni'n ymateb iddyn nhw, o ran safonau, rŷm ni'n hapus iawn bod y Papur Gwyn yn datgan bod y gyfundrefn safonau i barhau. Rŷm ni'n dechrau gweld cynnydd, rŷm ni'n dechrau gweld newid, rŷm ni'n clywed sefydliadau'n dweud wrthym ni, yn gymharol reolaidd nawr, yn arbennig y sefydliadau criw cyntaf yna, llywodraeth leol, eu bod nhw'n gwerthfawrogi'r safonau; maen nhw'n lico'r ffaith eu bod nhw'n rhannu'r un safonau, eu bod nhw'n gallu gweithio ar y cyd, ond hefyd bod yna eglurder o ran y

Other issues in the White Paper—. There are a huge number of them, but just to give you a flavour of some of the things that we'll be responding to, in terms of standards, we are very content that the White Paper states that the standards regime is to remain in place. We are starting to see progress, we are starting to see change, we hear organisations tell us, relatively regularly now, particularly those first cohort organisations, namely local government, say that they appreciate standards; they like the fact that they are sharing standards, that they can work together, but also that there is clarity in relation to the standards.

safonau. So, felly, rŷm ni'n croesawu'r ffaith bod y safonau'n parhau. Nid ŷm ni'n gyfforddus o gwbl â'r syniad mai'r Llywodraeth fydd yn gosod y safonau ar y sefydliadau. Mae problemau cyfansoddiadol yn y man cyntaf o ran ai gwleidyddion ddylai fod yn gosod safonau ar sefydliadau. Dyna'r cwestiwn cyntaf.

So, we welcome the fact that standards are to remain. We aren't at all comfortable with this idea that it's the Government that will impose standards on organisations. There are constitutional difficulties in the first place as to whether politicians should be imposing standards on organisations. That's the first question.

[13] Yr ail gwestiwn wedyn rydw i'n credu sy'n codi yw natur y berthynas sydd yn datblygu rhwng rheoleiddiwr a'r corff sy'n cael ei reoleiddio wrth osod y safonau. Rŷm ni wedi mynd trwy chwech—pump ac un wnaeth ddim digwydd, sef y rhai addysg, yn y lle cyntaf. Rŷm ni wedi mynd trwy bum set nawr o safonau, ac mae'r broses wedi esblygu. Mae hi wedi aeddfedu. Mae'r berthynas sydd rhyngom ni nawr a'r sefydliadau diwethaf, y colegau a'r prifysgolion, yn barod yn berthynas briodol, ond yn berthynas gryf o gyd-ddealltwriaeth o beth sy'n digwydd. Rydw i felly'n credu bod y broses gosod safonau sydd yn eistedd gyda'r comisiynydd ar hyn o bryd yn arwain at reoleiddio priodol, aeddfed, oherwydd bod y berthynas yna—ac nid yw hi'n berthynas gyffyrddus wastad—wedi cael ei chreu. So, felly, rŷm ni'n datgan yn eithaf clir ein bod ni'n anghyffyrddus iawn gyda'r syniad yma mai'r Llywodraeth a fuasai'n gosod y safonau.

The second question that arises is the nature of the relationship that develops between a regulator and the body that is regulated in imposing the standards. We've gone through six—five and one that didn't happen, namely for education, at the outset. We've gone through five sets of standards now, and the process has evolved and matured. The relationship between ourselves and the latest organisations, the colleges and universities, is already an appropriate relationship, but also a strong relationship, with a joint understanding of what is happening. I therefore feel that the process of imposing standards that currently sits with the commissioner does lead to appropriate and mature regulation, because that relationship is there. It's not always a comfortable relationship, but a relationship has been created. And, therefore, we are stating quite clearly that we are very uncomfortable with this concept that the Government would impose standards.

[14] A dyna ni, rydw i'n credu. I think that's it. We will be

Byddwn ni yn ymateb yn llawn, ond yr hyn a fuaswn i'n dymuno ei weld, â bod y Papur Gwyn yn symud ymlaen, yw, fel y dywedais i ar y dechrau, adeiladu ar beth sydd gyda ni, peidio â cholli'r momentwm presennol, adnabod y newid sy'n digwydd ar lawr gwlad, a bod unrhyw newidiadau yn hwyluso hynny yn hytrach na llesteirio hynny.

responding in full, but what I would like to see, given that the White Paper is to proceed, is that, as I said at the outset, we should build on what we already have in place—we shouldn't lose the momentum that we've generated, we should identify the changes happening on the ground, and any changes should facilitate them, rather than hamper them.

[15] **Bethan Jenkins:** Sian Gwenllian.

Bethan Jenkins: Sian Gwenllian.

[16] **Sian Gwenllian:** Diolch yn fawr iawn, ac rydw i jest eisiau gofyn ychydig o gwestiynau ynglŷn â'r Papur Gwyn. Rydych chi'n sôn y byddech chi'n hoffi gweld rheoleiddio a hybu a hyrwyddo yn parhau o fewn yr un un corff. A ydych chi'n meddwl y dylai'r corff yna fod o dan y Cynulliad yntau o dan y Llywodraeth? Mae hwnnw'n un cwestiwn. Wedyn, beth am yr elfen strategol? Oherwydd un ddadl sydd wedi ei chyflwyno ynghylch creu dau gorff ydy y byddai un yn gwneud rheoleiddio a'r llall yn cael y trosolwg strategol yna yn ogystal â hybu a hyrwyddo, a chydweithio â chynllunwyr iaith ac yn y blaen. Buaswn i'n hoffi gwybod—ddim heddiw, ond buasai bapur efallai ynglŷn â sut ydych chi'n meddwl dylid ystwytho'r broses fiwrocraidd yn ddefnyddiol, rydw i'n meddwl, ar y pwynt yma, ac o ran eich barn chi ynglŷn â'r ombudsmon yn cynnig efallai fod yn rheoleiddiwr yn y maes yma, os ydy o'n briodol i chi ymateb ar y cwestiwn yna.

Sian Gwenllian: Thank you very much, and I just have a few questions on the White Paper. You mentioned that you would like to see regulation and promotion continuing within the same organisation. Do you think that that organisation should be under the Government or the Assembly? That's one question. And what about the strategic element? Because one argument that's been presented in terms of creating two organisations is that one would look at regulation, and the other would have the strategic overview as well as promotion and working with language planners and so forth. I would like to know—not today, but a paper perhaps on how you think the bureaucratic process should be relaxed would be useful, I think, on this point, and in terms of your views on the ombudsman offering perhaps to be a regulator in this field, if it's appropriate for you to respond to that question.

[17] **Ms Huws:** lawn, diolch yn fawr. I ddechrau, ac i fynd nôl at y cwestiwn gwreiddiol, o ran hybu a hyrwyddo yn parhau gyda'r rheoleiddiwr, rydw i'n credu mai dyna yw un o'r problemau sydd yn bodoli ar hyn o bryd—nid oes yna ddim eglurder. Felly, rŷm ni'n croesawu'r ffaith bod yna drafodaeth ynglŷn â lle mae hybu a hyrwyddo yn eistedd. Pan ddaeth Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i ben, symudwyd lot fawr o'r gweithgaredd hybu a hyrwyddo yna i mewn i'r Llywodraeth. Symudwyd y tîm i mewn i'r Llywodraeth oedd yn delio â hynny. So, rydw i'n credu nad parhau byddwn ni, ond creu eglurder am le mae hybu a hyrwyddo i eistedd.

Ms Huws: Thank you very much. To return to the original question, in terms of promotion remaining with the regulator, I think that's one of the problems that exist at the moment, that there is no clarity. Therefore, we welcome the fact that there is to be a debate on where promotion of the language should sit. When the Welsh Language Board was abolished, many of the promotion activities were taken into Government. The team that dealt with that, in fact, was taken into Government. So, I do think that we wouldn't be continuing with the same system, but we would be providing clarity as to where promotion should sit.

[18] O ran bod yn atebol i'r Cynulliad neu'r Llywodraeth, rydw i'n credu mai atebol i'r Cynulliad y dylai sefydliad o'r math yma fod—perthynas agos â'r Llywodraeth wrth gwrs, yn naturiol. Byddem ni'n gweithio i'r un amcanion strategol, buaswn i'n gobeithio, neu buasai'r sefydliad yma, ond yn atebol i'r Cynulliad. Mae hwnnw'n rhywbeth rŷm ni wedi ei godi oddi ar ddyddiau cynnar y comisiynydd yma, yn ogystal â'r comisiynwyr eraill.

In terms of accountability to the Assembly or the Government, I do think that an organisation of this kind should be accountable to the Assembly. There'd be a close relationship with the Government, of course. We would be working to the same strategic objectives, I hope, or this organisation would, but accountable to the Assembly. That is an issue that we've raised since the early days of this commissioner, as well as the other commissioners.

[19] Cyfrannu at y cyfeiriad strategol yna—mae rheoleiddio yn gallu cael enw gwael, a buaswn i'n dweud bod rheoleiddio gwael yn gallu cael enw gwael. Ond mae rheoleiddio sydd yn bodoli er mwyn gwella gwasanaethau a gwella profiad

In terms of contributing to that strategic direction, regulation can get a bad reputation, and I'd say that bad regulation can get a bad reputation. But regulation that exists in order to improve services and to improve user experience can feed into strategy,

y defnyddiwr yn gallu bwydo i mewn i strategaeth, achos rŷch chi'n adnabod lle mae yna wendidau, rŷch chi'n adnabod lle mae yna gryfderau. Er enghraifft, ar hyn o bryd, rydym ni'n gwybod bod, o ran datblygu gwasanaethau i'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru, yna heriau o ran technoleg gwybodaeth. Wel, dyna gyfle i ddweud wrth y Llywodraeth, 'Mae angen i ni fuddsoddi mewn technoleg gwybodaeth yng Nghymru er mwyn hwyluso gwasanaethau'n cael eu darparu drwy'r ddwy iaith'.

because you identify where the weaknesses lie; you also identify the strengths. For example, at present, we know that, in terms of developing services for the public in Wales, there are challenges in terms of IT. Well, that's an opportunity to inform Government that we need to invest in information technology in Wales in order to facilitate the provision of services through both languages.

09:45

[20] So, felly, rydw i'n gallu gweld rheoleiddio effeithiol yn rhan o'r cyfeiriad strategol, efallai ddim yn rhan anferth, ond mae'r negeseuon sy'n dod o'r broses yna—. Ac rŷm ni'n gweld hynny o'r cwynion rŷm ni yn eu derbyn. Mae yna broblemau sefydliadol, mae yna broblemau sectorol, mae yna broblemau daearyddol yn y fan hyn, a gellid eu taclo nhw felly ar lefel strategol. So, rydw i'n gallu gweld y ddau beth yn eistedd yn reit gyfforddus. Byddwn yn fwy na hapus i ddarparu papur i chi.

So, I do believe that effective regulation can be part of the strategic direction, perhaps not a huge part, but the messages that emerge from that process are of assistance. And we see that from the complaints that we receive. We can identify institutional and sectoral problems, and even geographical problems, and we can tackle them at a strategic level. So, I can see both things sitting quite comfortably together. I would be more than happy to provide you with a paper.

[21] Cais neu gynnig yr ombwdsmon i wneud y gwaith o ran delio â chwynion, yn benodol y gwaith ymchwilio i gwynion—neis i dderbyn cymorth oddi wrth unrhyw un, wrth gwrs, ac rwy'n falch bod ganddo fe ddiddordeb. Ond, os ydych chi'n edrych ar yr hyn yr ŷm yn

In terms of the ombudsman's suggestion that his office could do the work in relation to complaints, specifically inquiries into complaints, I'm happy to receive support from anyone, of course, and I'm pleased that the ombudsman has an interest in this area. But, if you do look at

ceisio'i wneud wrth ddelio â chwynion, mae e ychydig yn wahanol i beth mae'r ombwdsmon yn ei wneud. Beth mae'r ombwdsmon, a beth mae ombwdsmon yn draws y byd, yn ei wneud yw unioni rhywbeth sydd wedi mynd o'i le rhwng unigolyn a sefydliad, a gwneud yn iawn am hynny. So, dyna yw natur ombwdsmon: i fod yn siarad dros y dinesydd, ac yn sicrhau bod yr unigolyn yna sydd wedi cael cam—bod hwnnw'n cael ei unioni. Mae yna elfen o hynny'n digwydd gyda'r cwynion rŷm ni'n delio â nhw. Mae rhywun yn teimlo eu bod nhw wedi cael cam gan sefydliad, ac rŷm ni'n ceisio delio â hynny. Ond beth mae'r cwynion yn eu gwneud i ni hefyd yw rhoi tystiolaeth cadarn, cyfoethog, ynglŷn â'r sefydliad yn ei gyfanrwydd, problemau systemig, ac felly, i ni, mae'n rhan o'n swyddogaeth ni o hybu a hwyluso'r defnydd o'r Gymraeg yng Nghymru yn gyffredinol. Mae'n eistedd yn gyfforddus ochr yn ochr—mae cwynion yn eistedd yn gyfforddus ochr yn ochr â'r gwaith monitro rŷm ni'n ei wneud, y cyswllt dyddiol gyda'r sefydliadau. So, felly, buasai tynnu cwynion i ffwrdd a'u gosod nhw mewn sefydliad arall—buaswn i'n colli darn o'r pecyn yna o adnoddau sydd gyda ni i greu newid. So, felly, nid ydw i'n gweld y gwerth, oherwydd buaswn i'n colli—ac nid ydw i'n lico'r term 'arf'—ond buaswn i'n colli arf yn y pecyn sydd gyda ni o greu newid.

what we are trying to do in dealing with complaints, it's slightly different to the ombudsman's approach. What the ombudsman does, and what ombudsmen across the world do, is to provide redress when something has gone wrong between an individual and an institution. That's the nature of the ombudsman's role: it's speaking on behalf of the citizen and ensuring that that individual who has made a complaint does receive some sort of redress, or that that's put right. There are elements of that in terms of the complaints that we deal with. People feel that they haven't been treated properly and we try and deal with that. But what the complaints also provide us with is a wealth of evidence on the organisation as a whole, any systemic problems within that organisation, and so, for us, it is part of our function in promoting and facilitating the use of the Welsh language in Wales. It sits comfortably alongside—complaints sit comfortably alongside the monitoring work that we carry out, the daily relationship that we have with these organisations. So, withdrawing complaints and placing them within another organisation would take away a piece of that package of resources that we have in order to generate change. So, I don't see the value of that, because we would lose—and I don't like the word 'tool'—but we would lose one of the tools that we have in generating change.

[22] **Sian Gwenllian:** Diolch.

Sian Gwenllian: Thank you.

[23] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae'n rhaid i ni symud ymlaen, sori. Felly, mae gan Suzy Davies gwestiynau.

Bethan Jenkins: We have to move on, sorry. Suzy Davies has some questions.

[24] **Suzy Davies:** Diolch yn fawr. Rŷch chi wedi sôn am weld cynnydd yn eithaf diweddar, ac rŷch chi wedi gweld hefyd teimlad gwell tuag at y safonau ym mhob sefydliad sy'n cael eu heffeithio ganddyn nhw. Ond rŷch chi wedi sôn hefyd am fomentwm araf o ran rhan o'r broses yma. Ac, wrth gwrs, mae'r mwyafrif o sefydliadau mawr cyhoeddus yn dal i weithredu cynlluniau yn lle safonau. A yw'n bosib i chi ddweud beth yw'r rhwystrau rhag gweithredu safonau mewn mwy o sefydliadau cyhoeddus ar hyn o bryd? Beth yw'r rhwystrau yr ŷm ni'n gallu eu gweld?

Suzy Davies: Thank you very much. You've mentioned seeing progress lately, and you've also seen a better attitude towards the standards in organisations that are affected by them. But you've also mentioned the slow momentum relating to part of this process. And, of course, the majority of large public organisations are still implementing Welsh language schemes rather than standards. Is it possible for you to tell us what the barriers are to implementing standards in more public organisations at present? What are the barriers that we can see?

[25] **Ms Huws:** A ydych chi eisiau pigo i fyny ar hwnnw?

Ms Huws: Do you want to pick up on that?

[26] **Mr Sion:** Ocê. Wel, jest o ran y cyd-destun i ddechrau, rydym ni wedi gweithio yn fwyaf diweddar efo prifysgolion a cholegau addysg bellach. Felly, mi wnaethom ni rhoi'r dyletswyddau terfynol arnyn nhw ddiwedd mis Medi. Mae yna gyfnod statudol o chwech mis wedyn cyn bod y safonau'n dod yn weithredol. Felly, mi fyddan nhw'n weithredol yn y cyrff yna o fis Ebrill ymlaen. Erbyn y pwynt yna wedyn, mi fydd yna 103, rydw i'n meddwl, o gyrff cyhoeddus, yn gweithredu safonau. Felly, mae'n bwysig cofio hynny yn y lle cyntaf.

Mr Sion: Okay. Well, just in terms of the context, first of all, we have been working most recently with universities and further education colleges. So, we placed the final responsibilities on them at the end of September. There's a statutory period of six months then before the standards are implemented. And, therefore, they will be implemented within those organisations from April onwards. By that point, there will be 103 public bodies, I think, implementing standards. It's important to bear that in mind first

Felly, rydym ni'n sôn am fwyafrif y cyrff cyhoeddus mawr yng Nghymru. of all. So, we are talking about the majority of major public bodies within Wales.

[27] Yr un eithriad amlwg i hynny ydy'r sector iechyd, ac mae'n deg dweud ein bod ni i gyd efallai wedi bod yn disgwyl gweld rheoliadau ar safonau ar gyfer y sector iechyd ers dipyn erbyn hyn. Rydw i'n meddwl mai rhan o'r rheswm bod yna oedi wedi bod ydy oherwydd y drafodaeth ar y Papur Gwyn. Felly, mae hynny wedi oedi'r broses o osod rheoliadau yn y cyfamser. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud ymrwymiad i gyflwyno'r rheoliadau iechyd cyn diwedd y flwyddyn galendr. Felly, rydym ni'n edrych ymlaen i weld y rheini yn fuan.

The one obvious exception to that is the health sector, and it is fair to say that we have all been expecting the regulations for standards for the health sector for quite some time now. I think part of the reason for the delay in that is because of the discussion on the White Paper. So, that's delayed the process of laying regulations in the meantime. The Minister has made a commitment to introduce the health regulations before the end of the calendar year. So, we look forward to seeing those soon.

[28] O ran cyrff eraill wedyn a sectorau— Now, in terms of other bodies and sector—

[29] **Suzy Davies:** Cyn i chi symud ymlaen, a allaf jest ganolbwyntio ar rywbeth yma? Rŷch chi wedi dweud bod trafodaethau ynghylch y Papur Gwyn wedi oedi cynnydd ar y safonau iechyd. Pam ydych chi'n dweud hynny? Achos mae'r ymgynghoriad wedi dod i ben fisoedd yn ôl.

Suzy Davies: Before you move on, can I just concentrate on something here? You said that discussions around the White Paper have delayed progress on the health standards. Why are you saying that? Because the consultation came to an end months ago.

[30] **Mr Sion:** Na. O ran y Papur Gwyn ar y cynigion ar gyfer Bil newydd, mae'r ymgynghoriad yna'n dod i ben dydd Mawrth. Felly, yn ystod y cyfnod yna, ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth oedd na fyddan nhw'n cyflwyno unrhyw rheoliadau pellach— hynny ydy, eu bod nhw angen y

Mr Sion: No. In terms of the White Paper on the proposals for a new Bill, that consultation comes to an end on Tuesday. So, during that period, the Government's commitment was that they would not introduce further regulations—that they needed to have that debate on the future of the

drafodaeth yna ynglŷn â dyfodol y ddeddfwriaeth. Felly, wrth gyflwyno'r Papur Gwyn, beth y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i ddweud ydy y byddan nhw'n cyflwyno rheoliadau safonau ar gyfer y sector iechyd cyn diwedd y flwyddyn galendr.

legislation. So, in introducing the White Paper, what the Minister has said is that they will introduce standards regulations for the health sector before the end of the calendar year.

[31] **Suzy Davies:** Felly, mae e wedi dewis arafu'r penderfyniadau dros y—

Suzy Davies: So, he has decided to slow down the decisions—

[32] **Mr Sion:** Do. Y penderfyniad sydd wedi'i wneud ydy i beidio â chyflwyno rhagor o reoliadau yn ystod y cyfnod yna o ymgynghori ar y ddeddfwriaeth. Ond, fel rwy'n ei ddweud, mae yna ymrwymiad i gyflwyno rheoliadau safonau iechyd cyn diwedd y flwyddyn galendr.

Mr Sion: Yes. The decision taken was not to introduce further regulations during that period of consultation on the legislation. But, as I say, there is a commitment to introduce health standards regulations before the end of the calendar year.

[33] **Suzy Davies:** Beth oedd y rheswm a roddodd e i chi?

Suzy Davies: What was the reason he provided to you?

[34] **Mr Sion:** Rwy'n meddwl mai'r rheswm cyhoeddus sydd wedi cael ei roi ydy oherwydd, yn ystod cyfnod o drafod Deddf newydd, ni fyddai'n briodol wedyn i gyflwyno rhagor o reoliadau.

Ms Sion: I think that the reason given publicly is because, during a period of discussion on new legislation, it wouldn't be appropriate to bring forward further regulations.

[35] **Suzy Davies:** Ocê, diolch am hynny. Ai dyna'r rheswm hefyd pam nad ydym wedi gweld tipyn bach o gynnydd ar sectorau eraill fel dŵr a threnau a bysys ac yn y blaen?

Suzy Davies: Okay, thank you for that. Is that also the reason why we haven't seen much progress in other sectors, such as water, trains and buses and so forth?

[36] **Mr Sion:** Ie. O ran sectorau eraill wedyn, mi fyddwch yn ymwybodol efallai fod y cam cyntaf yn y broses ymchwiliadau safonau yn ein gofal ni, fel comisiynydd. Felly,

Ms Sion: Yes. In terms of the other sectors, you will perhaps be aware that the first step in the process of standards inquiries sits with us, as the commissioner's office. So, we

rŷm ni wedi gwneud y cam yna efo nifer o sectorau eraill rŷch chi wedi sôn amdany'n nhw—felly, cymdeithasau tai, cwmnïau nwy a thrydan, ac yn y blaen. Felly, rŷm ni wedi cyflwyno adroddiadau ar y sectorau yna i'r Llywodraeth. Nid ydym wedi gweld rheoliadau safonau ar y sectorau yna eto. Rŷm ni'n gwybod mai'r sector iechyd fydd nesaf.

have undertaken that step with a number of other sectors that you've mentioned—housing associations, gas and electricity companies and so on. So, we have presented reports on those sectors to the Government. We haven't seen standards regulations on those sectors as of yet. We know that the health sector is next in line.

[37] Mae'r Llywodraeth hefyd wedi ymgynghori ar reoliadau drafft ar gyfer y sector cwmnïau dŵr. Rŷm ni'n gwybod hefyd eu bod nhw wedi bod yn paratoi ar gyfer cymdeithasau tai, felly rydym yn obeithiol y bydd y sectorau yna'n dod trwodd yn fuan. Ond mae yna eithaf tipyn o sectorau ar hyn o bryd lle mae'r camau cyntaf wedi'u cymryd, ond nid oes rheoliadau wedi dilyn eto.

The Government has also consulted on draft regulations for the water companies. We also know that they have been preparing the ground for housing associations, so we are hopeful that those sectors will come through soon. But there are quite a few sectors now, where the initial steps have been taken, but no regulations have been laid.

[38] **Suzy Davies:** Felly, nid yw'ch amserlen chi wedi cael ei heffeithio, ond mae beth sy'n digwydd nesaf wedi cael ei effeithio.

Suzy Davies: Therefore, your timetable hasn't been affected, but what is happening next has been affected.

[39] **Mr Sion:** Ydy. Rwy'n meddwl, erbyn hyn rŷan, gan ein bod ni wedi gorffen gweithio efo'r prifysgolion a'r colegau addysg bellach, rŷm ni wedi gweithio efo pob corff rŷm ni'n gallu ar y pwynt yma. Felly, cyn y gallwn ni osod mwy o safonau, mae'n rhaid i ni gael mwy o reoliadau trwy'r Cynulliad. Wedyn, y sector nesaf y byddwn ni'n gweithio efo fo fydd y sector iechyd.

Mr Sion: Yes. I think by this point, because we have concluded our work with universities and further education colleges, we have worked with every organisation that we can at this point. So, before we can implement further standards, we need more regulations through the Assembly. So, the next sector that we will be working with will be the health sector.

[40] **Suzy Davies:** A'r unig reswm yw'r trafodaethau ynghylch y Papur Gwyn a beth ddywedodd y Gweinidog cyn hynny. **Suzy Davies:** And the only reason is because of the discussion around the White Paper and what the Minister said before.

[41] **Mr Sion:** Ie. Yn achos rheoliadau'r sector iechyd, mi roedd rhaid i'r trafodaethau yna, yr ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus yna, ddigwydd yn gyntaf, yn ôl beth rŷm ni'n ei ddeall, ac wedyn rheoliadau pellach yn cael eu cyflwyno. **Mr Sion:** Yes. In relation to the health sector regulations, then those discussions and that public consultation had to happen first, as we understand it, and then further regulations would be brought forward.

[42] **Ms Huws:** A gaf i ddweud o ran y sector iechyd? Erbyn hyn, mae hynny'n creu problemau ar lawr gwlad oherwydd y mae gofal cymdeithasol yn gweithredu erbyn hyn, ers blwyddyn a hanner, o fewn safonau. Mae'r sector iechyd, sydd yn bartner agos iawn i ofal cymdeithasol, yn gweithio o fewn cyfundrefnau eraill. Rwy'n clywed, wrth fy mod i'n mynd o gwmpas ac yn siarad â phenaethiaid, fod yna ddwy gyfundrefn yn rhedeg a bod yna ddim cyfleodd i redeg o fewn yr un strwythur. Mae hynny'n peri pryder i fi oherwydd mae yna gyfle yn cael ei golli yn fan hyn. **Ms Huws:** Could I just say, in terms of the health sector? By now that does create problems at a grass-roots level because social care has been operating within the standards for a year and a half. The health sector, which is a close partner to social care, is working within different regimes. As I go around and talk to various heads, there is frustration that there are two regimes running separately and that there are no opportunities to run within the same structures. That is a cause of concern for me because an opportunity is being lost here.

[43] **Suzy Davies:** Diolch am hynny. Diolch, Cadeirydd. **Suzy Davies:** Thank you for that. Thank you, Chair.

[44] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy Miles.

[45] **Jeremy Miles:** A gaf i ofyn cwestiwn am y sector iechyd yn gyffredinol? Pan rŷch chi ar fin dechrau'r broses o osod safonau, a **Jeremy Miles:** Can I ask a question about the health sector in general? When you're in the process of implementing standards, do you

ydych chi'n gwneud gwaith hybu a pharatoi'r tir o flaen llaw—paratoi'r gweithlu a pharatoi'r sefydliadau? Mae'r gwaith hynny'n digwydd, ydy e?

undertaken promotion and prepare for this work—prepare the workforce and organisations? That work is happening, is it?

[46] **Ms Huws:** Wyt ti eisiau sôn am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn gyffredinol ac fe wnaf i sôn am ieched yn benodol a beth sy'n digwydd?

Ms Huws: Do you want to mention what's happening more generally, and I'll cover health specifically?

[47] **Mr Sion:** Iawn. O ran y gwaith o osod safonau, felly, yn gyffredinol, mi ydym ni erbyn hyn yn cymryd eithaf tipyn o amser i ymgynghori efo sefydliadau. Felly, rwy'n meddwl bod honno efallai yn un wers rydym wedi'i dysgu wrth i'r broses fynd yn ei flaen. Felly, mae'r cyfnod o drafod ac ymgynghori bellach yn fwy, efallai, nag yr oedd ar y dechrau. Rwy'n meddwl bod hynny'n ddefnyddiol i'r sefydliadau, yn sicr o ran deall yn well beth ydy'r dyletswyddau a beth fydd yn cael ei osod arny'n nhw. Mae o'n well i ni hefyd, achos mae yn rhoi cyfle inni ystyried yn union beth ydy amgylchiadau cyrff hefyd ymlaen llaw. Felly, y gobaith wedyn ydy bod yr hysbysiad sy'n cael ei gyflwyno iddyn nhw'n derfynol yn agos iawn at beth y dylai fod.

Mr Sion: Yes. In terms of the work of imposing standards more generally, we do now take some time to consult with organisations. So, I think that's a lesson that we have learnt, as the process has evolved. So, that period of discussion and consultation is perhaps longer now than it was at the outset. I think that's useful for the organisations, certainly in terms of getting a better understanding of the duties imposed upon them. It's better for us too, because it gives us an opportunity to consider the exact circumstances of organisations, and the hope then is that the notice presented to them ultimately is very close to what it should be.

[48] Mae yna broses wedyn lle mae'r sefydliad yn gallu herio dyletswydd, ac mae hynny'n digwydd. Ond, fel rwy'n ei ddweud, mae'r cyfnod yna o ymgynghori a thrafod bellach ychydig yn hirach. Rydym hefyd yn ceisio sicrhau ein bod ni'n cyfarfod â phob sefydliad, fel bod yna

There is then a process by which an organisation can challenge a duty imposed, and that does happen. But, as I've said, that period of consultation and further discussion is now slightly longer. We also try and ensure that we meet every organisation, so that there is face-

gyswllt wyneb yn wyneb a phersonol yn digwydd yn ystod y cyfnod yna hefyd.

to-face contact and personal contact during that period too.

[49] **Ms Huws:** Ac, o sôn yn benodol am y sector iechyd—oherwydd efallai ein bod ni wedi disgwyl bod y safonau yna yn gweld golau dydd dipyn cyn hyn—mae yna berthynas gadarn iawn wedi cael ei sefydlu â'r sector iechyd ar lefel—. Rwy'n cwrdd â'r prif weithredwyr drwy'r GIG yn eithaf aml. Mae yna berthynas unigol wedi'i sefydlu â chadeiryddion—rhai'n gryfach o ran perthynas nag eraill. Felly, rwy'n gweithio gyda'r prif swyddogion er mwyn iddyn nhw ddeall beth sydd yn mynd i ddigwydd. Er enghraifft, mae yna berthynas iach iawn, iawn rhyngof i a'r prif swyddogion lawr yn Hywel Dda; mae'n berthynas sydd wedi tyfu ar hyd y blynyddoedd.

Ms Huws: And, talking specifically about the health sector—because we'd perhaps expected those standards to have come to light much earlier than now—there is a very robust relationship that's been established with the health sector on the level—. I, for example, meet chief executives through the NHS quite often, and an individual relationship has been established with the chairs—some are stronger in terms of a relationship than others. So, I work with the senior officials so that they understand what is going to happen. For example, there is a very healthy relationship between me and senior officials down in Hywel Dda, and this has grown over the years.

[50] Rŷm ni wedyn yn gweithio gyda'r cyrff proffesiynol, y rhai sydd yn cynrychioli'r gweithlu. Mae yna berthynas, eto, iach iawn wedi datblygu rhyngom ni a'r cyrff proffesiynol, a'r colegau brenhinol—colegau brenhinol yn gweithredu yng Nghymru a thu fas i Gymru. Mae yna gyswllt cryf iawn â'r Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol ar lefel Llundain, er mwyn iddyn nhw ddeall beth a fydd yn angenrheidiol. Ac mae hynny'n wir am y colegau brenhinol i gyd.

We then work with the professional bodies, those bodies that represent the workforce. Again, there is a very healthy relationship that's developed between us and the professional bodies, and the royal colleges—the royal colleges operating in Wales and also outside Wales. There is a strong link with the Royal College of Nursing in London, in order for them to understand what will be necessary. And that is true to say of all the royal colleges.

[51] Wedyn, rŷm ni'n gweithio fel yr ŷm ni wedi bod yn gwneud, achos, wrth gwrs, mae'r byrddau iechyd yn

And then, we work as we have been doing, because, of course, the health boards are still operating under their

dal i weithredu o dan eu cynlluniau iaith traddodiadol, ac felly mae yna berthynas draddodiadol â'r swyddogion iaith ym mhob un o'r byrddau hefyd sydd wedi—. Wrth gwrs, rŷm ni wedi bod yn treulio amser yn trafod beth fydd y newid pan ddaw e. Felly, mae'n digwydd ar sawl gwahanol lefel gyda'r sector yna.

traditional language schemes, and there is a traditional relationship with the language officials in each of the boards that has—. Of course, we've been spending time discussing what the changes will be when they happen. So, it happens on a number of different levels with that sector.

[52] **Jeremy Miles:** Yn nhermau allbwn y prosesau, y perthnasau yna, a ydych chi'n gweld bod y broses yna yn newid pethau ar lawr gwlad yn barod—newid ymddygiad, newid agwedd, newid penderfyniadau staffio, darpariaeth ymlaen llaw, fel petai?

Jeremy Miles: In terms of the output of those processes, those relationships, do you believe that that process is changing things on the ground already—is it changing attitudes, changing behaviours, changing staffing decisions, in terms of making that provision?

[53] **Mr Sion:** Rwy'n meddwl, o ran y sector iechyd, cwpl o bethau fuaswn i'n dweud. Rydym ni wedi gwneud gwaith penodol yn y sector iechyd y tu allan i'r drefn safonau hefyd. Gwnaethom ni gynnal ymholiad iechyd gwpl o flynyddoedd yn ôl a oedd yn edrych ar ofal sylfaenol yn benodol, ond mae'r gwaith yna, rwy'n meddwl, wedi arwain at wella hefyd o ran ymwybyddiaeth a chynllunio yn fwy cyffredinol na hynny. Felly, mae yna bethau cadarnhaol yn digwydd, ac mae ymwybyddiaeth yn sicr yn uwch nag oedd hi.

Mr Sion: I think that, in terms of the health sector, I'd say a couple of things. We have undertaken work specifically in the health sector outside the standards regime. We held a health inquiry a few years ago that looked at primary care, and that work, I think, has led to an improvement also in awareness and planning on a more general level. Therefore, there are positive things that are happening, and awareness is certainly much better than it was.

[54] Wedi dweud hynny, ac rwy'n meddwl y byddwch chi'n trafod yr adroddiad sicrwydd nes ymlaen, mae yna *issues* yn codi o ran y sector

Having said that, of course, and I think you'll be discussing the assurance report later on, there are issues in terms of the health sector

iechyd ac o ran gwasanaethau Cymraeg. Nid ydy'r perfformiad gystal ag y mae mewn sectorau eraill, ond efallai y bydd hynny'n codi yn nes ymlaen y bore yma.

and in terms of Welsh language services. The performance isn't as good as in other sectors, but perhaps that will become apparent later on this morning.

[55] **Jeremy Miles:** Océ.

Jeremy Miles: Okay.

[56] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy, sori, ond cyn iti symud ymlaen at y gyllideb, mae Lee Waters a Siân eisiau dod i mewn ar y pwynt yma.

Bethan Jenkins: Jeremy, sorry, but before we move on to the budget, Lee Waters and Siân want to come in at this point.

[57] **Lee Waters:** I just want to ask you specifically about the anxiety within the health sector about the impact on the recruitment problems they have of imposing further restrictions on their ability to recruit, and your reflections on those anxieties.

[58] **Ms Huws:** Rŷm ni'n ymwybodol iawn, iawn o'r heriau sydd yn y sector iechyd. Mae'n ffaith ein bod ni wedi bod yn cydweithio â'r byrddau a'r cyrff proffesiynol, y colegau brenhinol ac eraill, ers pum mlynedd nawr. Rŷm ni'n gwybod beth yw'r heriau mawr, ac rŷm ni'n sensitif i'r rheini, yn llwyr sensitif i'r rheini. Dyma pam yr wyf i wedi gwerthfawrogi cael y berthynas â'r sefydliadau, er mwyn edrych ar ffyrdd o ymateb i hynny. Er enghraifft, rhywbeth syml i ddechrau: nid oedd y byrddau iechyd—ac mae yna wendidau o hyd yn y system—yn cofnodi sgiliau ieithyddol y gweithwyr presennol ac efallai'n colli cyfle yn fanna am eu bod nhw ddim yn adnabod lle mae eu siaradwyr Cymraeg nhw, boed nhw'n therapyddion, yn ddeintyddion, yn nyrsys, ac yn y blaen. Felly, rŷm ni

Ms Huws: We are highly aware of the challenges within the health sector. The fact is that we have been working with the health boards and professional bodies, and the royal colleges and others for five years. We know what those major challenges are, and we are sensitive to those challenges. That is why I have appreciated developing this relationship with the organisations involved, in order to look at ways of responding to those challenges. For example, a simple thing first of all: the health boards—and there are still weaknesses in the system—don't record the linguistic skills of their current workforce, and they may be missing an opportunity there, that they are not identifying where they already have Welsh speakers, be they therapists, dentists, nurses, and so on. So, we've been working along

wedi bod yn gweithio ochr yn ochr â nhw wrth eu bod yn ceisio datblygu cofrestrau. with them as they try and develop registers.

10:00

[59] Rŷm ni hefyd yn gweithio gyda nhw o ran ffeindio ffyrdd dychmygus, gwahanol o ateb anghenion. Sut ydych chi'n defnyddio nyrs mewn sefyllfa glinigol lle efallai nad yw'r doctor yn siarad Cymraeg? Sut ydych chi'n gwneud hynny yn broffesiynol, wrth gwrs? Sut ydych chi'n strwythuro'ch *shifts* er mwyn sicrhau bod rhywun yna sydd yn gallu delio, efallai, gyda phlentyn nad yw'n gallu siarad Saesneg neu rywun sy'n dioddef o ddementia neu'n dioddef o strôc ac felly ddim yn gallu cyfathrebu yn Saesneg? We have also worked with them in terms of finding new and imaginative ways of responding to needs. How do you use a nurse in a clinical situation where the doctor perhaps doesn't speak Welsh? How do you do that professionally, of course? How do you structure your shifts in order to ensure that there is someone there who can deal, let's say, with a child who can't speak English or a dementia patient or a stroke patient who can't communicate through the medium of English?

[60] Rwyf wedi gweld esiamplau gwych lle mae byrddau iechyd, yn arbennig yn y de-ddwyrain, wedi cynllunio er mwyn—ac nid jest y de-ddwyrain, rwyf wedi eu gweld mewn llefydd eraill hefyd—lle maen nhw'n ymateb i hynny. I have seen excellent examples where health boards, particularly in the south-east, have been planning—but not just the south-east, I've seen it elsewhere too—I have seen them respond to that.

[61] Rwy'n credu bod yna fater sydd tu fas i safonau, sydd tu fas i gynlluniau iaith o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae yna gorff newydd yn cael ei sefydlu nawr. Fe glywsom ni ddatganiad dros yr haf bod yna gorff newydd a fydd yn gyfrifol am addysg o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd—yr *health education and improvement unit*. Rwy'n credu bod yna gyfle fan hyn i ddechrau cynllunio at y dyfodol. I do think that there is an issue outwith standards, and outwith language schemes in terms of the health service. A new body is now being established. We heard a statement over the summer that a new body will be responsible for education within the health service—the health education and improvement unit. I do think there is an opportunity there to start to plan

for the future.

[62] Nid yw'n mynd i ddigwydd dros nos, ond mae'n rhaid inni ddechrau cynllunio nawr. Mae'n cymryd saith mlynedd i gael doctor mas o'r system, mae'n cymryd tair i gael nyrs drwyddo. Nawr mae angen i ni ddechrau rhoi sgiliau yn y Gymraeg fel rhan o'r pecyn yna o sgiliau proffesiynol yng Nghymru—y gallu i gyfathrebu yn effeithiol mewn dwy iaith, fel rhan o'r pecyn.

It's not going to happen overnight, but we do have to start planning now. It takes seven years to train a doctor through the system and three to train a nurse. We now need to start placing Welsh language skills as part of that package of professional skills in Wales—the ability to communicate effectively in two languages, as part of the package.

[63] So, mae yna lot o bethau yn digwydd ac mae hyn yn gynnrych, buaswn i'n dweud, trafodaethau parhaol, anodd ar adegau, gyda'r gwasanaeth. Rwy'n cwrdd ag Andrew Goodall bob chwarter er mwyn edrych ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd, ac a fydd angen digwydd hefyd, ar sawl gwahanol lefel, nid jest safonau.

So, there are a number of things happening and they are a product, I would say, of ongoing discussions, which can be difficult, happening with the service. I meet with Andrew Goodall every quarter in order to look at what is happening, and what needs to happen for the future, on many different levels, not just in terms of standards.

[64] **Lee Waters:** Diolch.

Lee Waters: Thank you.

[65] **Bethan Jenkins:** Siân Gwenllian.

[66] **Siân Gwenllian:** Yn amlwg, rydych chi yn cydweithio'n glos efo'r cyrff yma cyn i'r safonau gyrraedd y pwynt lle maen nhw'n cael eu gosod. Petai yna unrhyw wanio ar y broses ddeddfwriaethol yna, unrhyw dynnu nôl ar unrhyw faint o'r grym deddfwriaethol yna, a ydych chi'n meddwl y byddai'n gwneud gwahaniaeth?

Siân Gwenllian: Clearly, you do work very closely with these organisations before the standards reach the point where they're implemented. If there was any weakening of that legislative process, any pulling back on some of that legislative power, do you think that would make a difference?

[67] **Ms Huws:** Ydw. Rwyf wedi

Ms Huws: I do, yes. I have seen a

gweld gwahaniaeth sylfaenol sylweddol yn y berthynas rhwng Comisiynydd y Gymraeg a'r cyrff oherwydd natur y broses reoleiddio. Os ydych chi'n rheoleiddio er mwyn cynnydd ac er mwyn gwella, mae'r berthynas yna—sydd â cham gorfodi ar ddiwedd y dydd—yn creu perthynas gref, gadarn, rhwng y sefydliadau.

fundamental significant difference in terms of the relationship between the Welsh Language Commissioner and the organisations because of the nature of the regulatory process. If you regulate for progress and improvement then that relationship—which does have enforcement steps, ultimately—does create a strong, robust relationship between the organisations.

[68] Nid oedd yr un peth yn bod gyda'r cynlluniau iaith, a oedd yn wannach yn ddeddfwriaethol. Roedd cynlluniau iaith yn bodoli, ond yr unig gam gorfodi ar ddiwedd y daith oedd argymhell bod y sefydliad yn newid ei ffyrdd o weithio. Felly, rwyf yn gredwr yn y broses a'r elfen reoleiddio, sydd yn seiliedig ar ddeddfwriaeth, a bod hynny yn gallu arwain at gynnydd, o ddefnyddio'r pwerau yna'n briodol.

The same wasn't true with the language schemes, which were legislatively weaker. Language schemes did exist, but the only enforcement action that could be taken was to recommend that an organisation change its ways of working. So, I am a believer in this process and that regulatory element, which is based on legislation, and that can lead to progress, in using those powers appropriately.

[69] **Jeremy Miles:** A gaf i ofyn cwestiynau i chi ynglŷn â'ch cyllideb chi? Cyllideb 2018–19. Pa drafodaethau sy'n digwydd yng nghyd-destun hynny?

Jeremy Miles: Could I ask you questions on your budget? The 2018–19 budget. What discussions have happened in the context of that?

[70] **Ms Huws:** Fe aeth yr amcangyfrif i mewn gennym ni i'r Llywodraeth cyn diwedd yr haf. Fe wnaethom ni gynnig dau opsiwn. Fe wnaethom ni gynnig opsiwn a oedd yn opsiwn 2, sef fflat—ac fe wnaethom ni amlinellu beth fyddai, o gael cyllideb fflat, yn gorfod digwydd. Ac fe wnaethom ni gynnig opsiwn 1, a oedd yn gofyn am

Ms Huws: The estimate was submitted by us to the Government before the end of the summer. We offered two options. We offered one option, option 2, which was a flat budget—and we outlined, in having a flat budget, what would have to happen as a result of that. We also proposed option 1, namely asking for a little more funding in order to

ychydig yn fwy o arian er mwyn maintain services at the level they are
cynnal y gwasanaethau ar y lefel y at present.
maen nhw ar hyn o bryd.

[71] **Jeremy Miles:** Fflat yn nhermau **Jeremy Miles:** Flat in terms of the
cyllideb 2017–18 neu fflat yn 2017–18 budget or flat in terms of
nhermau gwariant 2017–18? Achos expenditure in 2017–18? Because
roedd rhywfaint o wahaniaeth. there was some sort of difference.

[72] **Ms Huws:** Oedd, roedd ychydig **Ms Huws:** Yes, there was some
o wahaniaeth. Rydym ni wedi gorfod difference. We have had to spend. We
gwario. Rydym ni yn defnyddio arian are using reserves, of course, to
wrth gefn, wrth gwrs, er mwyn ensure that our services are
sicrhau ein gwasanaeth ni. Yr hyn delivered. What's happened is that
sydd wedi digwydd yw ein bod ni we've received a flat budget
wedi cael cyllideb fflat. Fe glywsom ni allocation. We were informed of that
echdoe am hynny. Mae yna linell yn y the day before yesterday. There is a
gyllideb. Rydym ni'n derbyn hynny. budget line. We accept that. That's
Dyna realiti'r byd ar hyn o bryd. the reality of the situation that we are
Byddai cael fwy o arian, rwy'n siŵr, in. I think everyone would like more
yn sicr, i bawb, yn wych, ond, dyna money, but that's the reality and we
yw'r realiti ac fe wnawn ni weithio o will work within that.
fewn hynny.

[73] Beth sydd ddim yn mynd i What won't happen to the same
ddigwydd i'r un graddau efallai ag y extent as perhaps it would have
byddai wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol happened in the past is elements of
yw'r elfennau o waith ymchwil. Mae research work. Dyfan has mentioned
Dyfan wedi sôn am yr ymholiad our inquiry into health—which was so
iechyd a wnaethom ni—roedd hynny valuable—undertaken three or four
mor werthfawr—dair neu bedair years ago. That's generated
blynedd yn ôl. Mae hynny wedi creu momentum and further pieces of
momentwm darnau o waith sydd yn work have emerged from that which
dal i fodoli heddiw ac yn dal i barhau still exist today. Such an inquiry
heddiw. Ni fyddai ymholiad o'r math wouldn't be possible given the
yna yn bosibl gyda'r gyllideb ar hyn o current budget. The other side of the
bryd. Mae'n debyg mai'r ochr arall coin that doesn't receive as much
sydd ddim yn cael gymaint o adnodd resource as we would like is the
ag y buaswn i'n ei ddymuno yw'r promotion side, that softer work with
ochr hybu ac hyrwyddo, y gwaith organisations that perhaps aren't
meddalach yna efallai gyda'r currently under standards. Much of

sefydliadau sydd ddim o dan y that work does happen, and much
safonau. Mae lot fawr o'r gwaith more could happen, if the budget
yna'n digwydd, a gallai lot fwy o'r were larger.
gwaith yna ddigwydd pe bai'r
gyllideb yn fwy.

[74] Ond, wedi dweud hynny, yr un But, having said that, one thing we
peth yr ym ni'n ei wneud yw gweithio are doing is working jointly with
ar y cyd â sefydliadau eraill. Rŷm ni, other organisations. At the moment,
ar hyn o bryd, yn cynnal darnau o we are carrying out joint research
ymchwil ar y cyd gyda sefydliadau with third sector organisations and
trydydd sector, gyda'r Llywodraeth a with the Government, as well as with
gyda'r prifysgolion. So, mae modd universities. So, we can work jointly
gweithio ar y cyd i lenwi peth o'r *gap* in order to fill in some of those gaps.
yna.

[75] **Jeremy Miles:** Rŷch chi wedi **Jeremy Miles:** You've said in the past,
dweud yn y gorffennol, neu yn eich or in your evidence, that it's more
tystiolaeth, ei bod yn anoddach difficult to do non-statutory things
gwneud pethau anstatudol oherwydd because of cuts. Are those the kinds
toriadau. Ai dyna'r math o bethau yr of things that you've just explained?
ŷch chi newydd eu hesbonio?

[76] **Ms Huws:** Ie. **Ms Huws:** Yes.

[77] **Jeremy Miles:** Ocê. So, buasech **Jeremy Miles:** Okay. So, would you
chi'n dweud bod patrwm wedi say that a pattern has developed, that
datblygu, bod y gwaith hybu, er the promotion work, for example,
enghraifft, wedi lleihau neu wedi *flat-* has reduced or flattened out because
io mas achos bod toriadau wedi cuts have happened, or—? If we were
digwydd, neu—. Pe buasem ni'n looking at the trend, how would that
edrych ar y *trend*, sut y byddai look?
hwnnw'n edrych?

[78] **Mr Sion:** Rydw i'n meddwl ei **Mr Sion:** I think it's forced us to work
fod e wedi ein gorfodi i weithio mewn in different ways—as Meri said, more
ffyrdd gwahanol—fel y dywedodd collaboration. Certainly, in terms of
Meri, mwy o gydweithio, efallai. Yn research, we can't undertake as
sicr, o ran ymchwil, nid ydym ni'n much research ourselves. It's quite
gallu cynnal gymaint o ymchwil â an expensive activity in any case, so
hynny. Mae ymchwil, fel arfer, yn we do have to work with other

eithaf drud beth bynnag. Felly, rydym ni'n gorfod cydweithio efo cyrff eraill. Mae hynny'n wir o safbwynt y gwaith hybu hefyd. Mae peth o'r gwaith yna wedi bod yn eithaf defnyddiol ac yn eithaf da. Er enghraifft, rydym ni'n cydweithio llawer â chyrff fel y WCVA, Chwaraeon Cymru a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru i dargedu mudiadau, elusennau a chyrff gwirfoddol. Felly, mae wedi ein gorfodi ni i wneud mwy o hynny, sydd yn beth da. Mae ein gwaith hybu ni yn disgyn i ddau gategori, mewn gwirionedd, sef adnoddau a chanllawiau, ac wedyn gwaith sectorol. O ran yr adnoddau a'r canllawiau, mi fuasem ni'n gallu gwneud llawer mwy o hynny efo mwy o gyllideb. Y math o adnoddau a chanllawiau rydym ni'n eu cynnig yw sesiynau hyfforddiant, dogfennau canllaw, dogfennau cyngor. Hefyd, mae gennym ni brosiect lle'r ydym yn cynnig gwasanaeth prawfddarlenn am ddim, sydd yn boblogaidd efo mudiadau. Rydym ni hefyd yn rhoi cymorth iddyn nhw o ran y cynllun hybu, sydd yn dempled lle maen nhw'n gallu hunanasesu gwasanaethau ac wedyn yn gallu cynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol. Felly, y math yna o gynlluniau—buasem ni'n gallu gwneud mwy o'r rheini.

organisations. That's true in terms of the promotion work too. Some of that work has been quite useful and quite good. For example, we work a lot with organisations such as the WCVA, Sport Wales and the Arts Council of Wales in order to target organisations, charitable bodies and voluntary organisations. So, it's forced us to do more of that, which is a positive thing. Our promotion work falls into two categories, if truth be told, namely resources and guidance and then sectoral work. In terms of resources and guidance, we could do far more of that if we had a larger a budget. The type of things we offer are training sessions, guidance documents, advice documents. We also have a project where we offer a proofreading service free of charge, which is very popular with organisations. We also provide support to them in terms of the promotion plan, which is a template whereby they can self-assess their services and then plan for the future. So, it's those sorts of programmes that we could do more of.

[79] **Jeremy Miles:** Rwy'n deall y buasai mwy o gyllideb yn golygu eich bod chi'n gallu gwneud mwy, am resymau amlwg. Ond a ych chi'n dweud eich bod chi wedi gorfod gwneud llai oherwydd toriadau, neu a

Jeremy Miles: I understand that a bigger budget would mean that you could do more, for obvious reasons. But are you saying that you have had to do less because of cuts, or is the pattern not as clear as that? Has the

yw'r patrwm ddim mor glir â hynny? A yw'r allbwn wedi newid, neu a yw'r ffordd o weithio wedi eich galluogi chi i gynnal yr allbwn mewn ffyrdd gwahanol?

output changed, or has the change in the way that you work meant that you've been able to maintain the output in a different way?

[80] **Ms Huws:** Rydw i'n credu ein bod ni wedi cynnal y gwaith, ac rŷm ni wedi gwneud hynny drwy weithio gydag eraill, ac rydw i'n croesawu hynny. Rydw i'n gredwr cryf mewn gweithio gyda chyrff ymbarél ar eu tir eu hunain yn hytrach na chreu rhyw dir gwahanol yn rhywle arall lle mae'r Gymraeg yn bodoli. Rydw i'n credu yr hyn y buaswn ni'n ei ddweud yw bod yna gymaint o botensial mas yna. Jest edrych ar ein cyrsiau hyfforddiant ni: gallwn ni eu rhedeg nhw bum gwaith drosodd o ran galw, yn arbennig o'r trydydd sector, elusennau, sydd yn gweld y budd o'r rheini. So, rŷm ni wedi cynnal y gwaith. Nid ydw i'n credu bod yna dorri wedi bod oherwydd ein bod ni wedi edrych ar ffyrdd gwahanol o weithio. Ond, yn sicr, buasem ni'n gallu gwneud gymaint fwy, gallwn ni gyflawni gymaint yn fwy, o gael cyllideb fwy yn y maes yna.

Ms Huws: I think we've maintained our activity, and we've done that through working with others, and I welcome that. I'm a strong believer in operating with umbrella organisations on their own ground rather than creating new ground somewhere else where the Welsh language exists. I think that what I would say is that there is so much potential out there. If you just look at our training courses, we could run them five times over in terms of the demand for those courses, particularly from the third sector and the charities sector, which do see the benefit of that training. So, we've maintained our work. I don't think that there has been a cut in our work, because we have looked at different ways of working. But, certainly, we could do so much more, and we could achieve so much more in having an enhanced budget in that area.

[81] **Jeremy Miles:** Océ. Grêt. Diolch yn fawr. Diolch.

Jeremy Miles: Okay. Thank you very much.

[82] **Bethan Jenkins:** Sian Gwenllian.

Bethan Jenkins: Sian Gwenllian.

[83] **Sian Gwenllian:** Cwestiynau ynglŷn â dylanwadu ar bolisi a deddfwriaeth: a ydych chi'n meddwl bod y Gymraeg yn cael digon o le a

Sian Gwenllian: I have questions on influencing policy and legislation: do you believe that the Welsh language is given sufficient consideration and

digon o bwyslais gan wneuthurwyr polisi erbyn hyn?

weight by policymakers now?

[84] **Ms Huws:** Mae'r patrymau wedi newid yn ystod y pump, chwe blynedd diwethaf. Buaswn i'n dweud o ran—. Mae ystyriaeth o'r Gymraeg yn rhan annatod o feysydd polisi lle nad oedd hynny'n digwydd, buaswn i'n ei ddweud, chwe blynedd yn ôl. Mi allwch chi edrych ar weithgaredd y gwahanol bwyllgorau o fewn y Cynulliad. Bwydom ni i mewn, y llynedd, 26 o weithiau i drafodaethau polisi, naill ai ar lafar neu'n ysgrifenedig—o gynllunio i addysg i iechyd, llywodraeth leol, terminoleg, deddfwriaeth.

Ms Huws: The patterns have changed over the last five or six years. I would say that in terms of—. Consideration of the Welsh language is now an integral part of policy areas, whereas that wasn't the case six years ago. You can look at the activities of the various committees within the Assembly. Last year, we fed into policy discussions 26 times, either orally or in written form—from planning to education to health, local government, terminology, legislation.

[85] **Sian Gwenllian:** Yn yr achosion hynny, a wnaethon nhw wrando ar yr hyn yr oedd gennych chi i'w ddweud?

Sian Gwenllian: In those cases, did they listen to what you had to say?

[86] **Ms Huws:** Rydw i'n teimlo ein bod ni wedi cael dylanwad. Mi edrychaf i ar Dyfan mewn munud, fel y person sy'n gyfrifol am bolisi. Ond, o edrych, er enghraifft, ar y ddeddfwriaeth ddiweddaraf o ran anghenion addysg ychwanegol, rydw i'n teimlo ein bod ni wedi cael llais. Roedd hwnnw yn llais ar y cyd â'r comisiynydd plant. Roedd y ddwy ohonom ni yn bwydo i mewn gyda'n gilydd, ac ar wahân, i'r broses yna. Rydw i yn credu bod yr hyn a ddywedom ni o flaen y pwyllgor plant yn y Cynulliad diwethaf wedi bwydo i mewn i'r trafodaethau sydd wedi bod ynglŷn â'r WESPs a'r gwaith y mae Aled Roberts wedi'i wneud yn ystod

Ms Huws: I feel that we did have an influence. I will look to Dyfan in a minute, as the individual responsible for policy. But, in looking at the most recent legislation in terms of additional educational needs, I think our voice was heard. That was jointly with the children's commissioner—we both fed in jointly, and separately, to that process. I believe that what we told the children's committee in the last Assembly did feed into the discussions that have taken place on the WESPs and the work that Aled Roberts has been undertaking over the summer months. I also feel, returning to something that we discussed earlier, that what we've

yr haf yma. Rydw i yn teimlo hefyd, i fynd nôl at rywbeth trafodwn ni'n gynt, mae'r hyn rŷm ni wedi gallu gwneud o ran y maes iechyd, o ran polisi—rŷm ni wedi cynnal trafodaethau yn ddiweddar gyda Chadeirydd y pwyllgor iechyd o ran iechyd meddwl oedolion a gwasanaethau Cymraeg. So, felly, rydw i'n teimlo ein bod ni'n cael llais. Mae yna dystiolaeth bod yna ôl hwnnw ar ddeddfwriaeth sy'n dod trwyddo.

[87] **Mr Sion:** Oes; rydw i'n cytuno. Rydw i'n meddwl bod yna wahaniaeth mawr o'i gymharu â rhai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Buaswn i'n dweud pump, chwe blynedd yn ôl, yn aml iawn nad oedd yna ddim unrhyw ystyriaeth wedi bod i'r Gymraeg mewn rhai polisiau. Nid yw hynny yn wir fel y cyfryw bellach. Wedi dweud hynny, nid da lle gellir gwell, yn amlwg, ac er bod yna ystyriaeth yn aml i'r Gymraeg mewn nifer o wahanol feysydd, nid yw hi bob tro'r ystyriaeth y byddai rhywun yn ei ddisgwyl. So, mae yna waith pellach i'w wneud.

[88] Mae yna enghreifftiau gwych. Mae yna enghreifftiau eraill lle rydym ni'n teimlo ein bod ni'n gorfod ymyrryd er mwyn cynnal yr ystyriaeth yna i'r Gymraeg. Rydw i'n meddwl hefyd y pwynt arall pwysig ydy bod rôl pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad yn allweddol o ran hynny, o ran y craffu yna. Mae pethau wedi gwella, ond mae yna waith i'w wneud mewn sawl

achieved in terms of the health sector in terms of policy—I've had recent discussions with the Chair of the health committee in terms of adult mental health issues in relation to Welsh-language services. So, I do feel that we do have a voice. There is evidence that that voice is having an impact on the legislation that's emerging.

Mr Sion: Yes, I agree. I think there is a big difference compared to a few years ago. I would say, five or six years ago, that quite often no consideration was given to the Welsh language in some policies. That is not true on the whole now. Having said that, obviously there is always room for improvement, and even though consideration is given to the Welsh language in a number of areas, quite often it's not always the consideration that you'd expect. So, there is further work to be done.

So, there are good examples. There are other examples where we do feel that we have to intervene in order to give that consideration to the Welsh language. I also think the other important point is that the role of Assembly committees is key to that, in terms of that scrutiny. Things have improved, but there is work to be done in a number of areas still.

maes o hyd.

[89] **Sian Gwenllian:** A ydy un o'r meysydd yna yn cynnwys cynllunio, er enghraifft? Oherwydd rydym ni newydd gael canllaw cynllunio atodol yn ddiweddar, ac mae o i weld, yn ymddangos, yn wan iawn. Rydw i jest eisiau gwybod faint o ddylanwad gawsoch chi ar hwnnw.

Sian Gwenllian: Do those areas include planning, for example? Because we have recently had the supplementary planning guidance, and it does seem to be very weak. I just want to know how much influence you had on that.

[90] **Mr Sion:** Rydw i'n meddwl mi gafodd y Ddeddf Cynllunio (Cymru) 2015 ei phasio gan y Cynulliad rhyw dair blynedd yn ôl erbyn hyn. Mae yna ystyriaeth i'r Gymraeg yn y Ddeddf a hynny yn benodol am y tro cyntaf. Felly, roeddem ni'n falch o weld hynny, bod y Gymraeg yn ystyriaeth statudol yn y maes cynllunio am y tro cyntaf. Wedi dweud hynny, nid ydw i'n siŵr a ydy'r elfen yna wedi cael ei gweithredu fel byddem ni wedi dymuno yn dilyn hynny. Felly, mae yna bolisi cynllunio ar gyfer Cymru, nodyn cyngor technegol 20: bu'n rhaid i ni ddisgwyl yn eithaf hir i weld y nodyn hwnnw. Roedd yn drueni oherwydd, yn y cyfamser, mae yna nifer o gynlluniau datblygu lleol wedi'u datblygu a'u cymeradwyo. Felly, roedd hynny'n siomedig.

Mr Sion: I think the Planning (Wales) Act 2015 was passed by the Assembly some three years ago. Consideration is given to the Welsh language in that Act and that's for the first time. So, we were pleased to see that, that the Welsh language was a statutory consideration in the planning sphere for the very first time. Having said that, I'm not sure whether that element has been implemented as we would have wished, following that. So, there is a planning policy for Wales, technical advice note 20: now, we had to wait quite a long time before we saw that TAN, which was a shame, because in the meantime a number of local development plans have been developed and approved. So, that was disappointing.

[91] O ran cynnwys y nodyn sydd wedi'i gyhoeddi, mae yna rai pethau wedi newid ynddo fo, ond nid ydy o wedi mynd mor bell â byddem ni wedi dymuno o ran yr ystyriaeth sy'n gallu cael ei roi i geisiadau cynllunio unigol, er enghraifft. Wedyn—

In terms of the content of the TAN, there are some changes, but it hasn't gone as far as we would have liked to have seen in terms of the consideration that can be given to individual planning applications, for example. Then—

[92] **Sian Gwenllian:** Nid ydy o chwaith yn fandadol i unrhyw awdurdod lleol wneud asesiad ieithyddol wrth wneud eu cynlluniau datblygu lleol.

Sian Gwenllian: Neither is it mandatory for any local authority to carry out a linguistic assessment in drawing up their LDPs.

[93] **Mr Sion:** Wel, o ran y cynlluniau datblygu, mae'n ofynnol iddyn nhw wneud asesiad effaith ieithyddol fel rhan o'r arfarniad cynaladwyedd. Felly, mae hynny yn ofynnol. Beth sydd ddim yn ofynnol ydy gwneud asesiad wedyn ar gais cynllunio unigol. Ni fyddai rhywun yn disgwyl eu bod nhw'n eu gwneud ar gyfer pob un, yn amlwg. Beth roeddem ni yn chwilio amdano oedd bod gan yr awdurdod lleol yr hyblygrwydd i benderfynu pryd oedd ei angen, achos y tueddiad efo'r drefn cynllunio ydy bod popeth yn gorfod digwydd efo'r cynllun datblygu ac nid efo'r ceisiadau cynllunio unigol wedyn. Nid ydw i'n siŵr bod yr hyblygrwydd yna wedi dod trwodd yn y nodyn cyngor technegol.

Mr Sion: Well, in terms of a development plan, it is a requirement of them to carry out a linguistic impact assessment as part of the sustainability assessment. So, that's a requirement. What's not a requirement is an assessment of an individual planning proposal. Now, one wouldn't expect them to do that for every planning application, clearly. But what we were seeking was that the local authority should have the flexibility to decide when that was needed, because the tendency within the planning system is that everything has to happen under the LDP rather than under the individual planning applications. I'm not sure that that flexibility has emerged in the TAN.

[94] **Sian Gwenllian:** A oes yna feysydd eraill sydd yn peri'r un math o rwystredigaeth?

Sian Gwenllian: Are there other areas that cause the same sort of frustration?

10:15

[95] **Ms Huws:** Nid o ran rhwystredigaeth, ond rydw i'n credu mai un maes lle mae yna waith craffu pellach i'w wneud—rŷm ni wedi sôn am y WESPs; rydw i yn credu bod y maes addysg yn ei gyfanrwydd—.

Ms Huws: Not frustration, but one area where there is further scrutiny work to be done—and we've mentioned the WESPs; I do believe that education as a whole needs to be looked at. The Government has a

Mae'r Llywodraeth â tharged uchelgeisiol iawn o 2050, sydd i'w groesawu. Mae'r maes addysg yn ganolog i hynny, ac rydw i'n credu bod yna sawl elfen, nid yn unig y WESPs, sydd wedi bod yn wan yn y gorffennol—rydw i'n credu bod yn rhaid i ni edrych ar ddarpariaeth blynyddoedd cynnar fel rhan o'r pecyn yna. Rydw i'n credu bod hwnnw'n faes lle mae angen craffu caled ar Dechrau'n Deg—edrych ar y 30 awr o ofal cynnar. Sut mae hwnnw'n mynd i arwain at y targed yna?

very ambitious target of 2050, and we welcome that. Now, education is at the heart of that, and I do think that there are a number of elements, not only the WESPs, which have been weak in the past—I also think we need to look at early years provision as part of that package. I think that's an area where hard scrutiny is required in terms of Flying Start, looking at the 30 hours of childcare. How is that going to bring us towards that target?

[96] So, nid maes rhwystredigaeth, ond maes lle rydw i'n gweld yr angen i wneud darn o waith sylweddol os ydym i gyrraedd y nod yna. A hefyd efallai mae Cymraeg ail iaith yn rhan o'r pecyn yna.

So, it's not an area of frustration, but an area where I do see a significant piece of work needs to be done if we are to achieve that target. And also perhaps Welsh as a second language would be part of that package.

[97] **Mr Sion:** Sori, jest ar y pwynt yna'n gyflym iawn, rydym ni yn y broses o lunio nodiadau briffio ar gyfer y maes blynyddoedd cynnar. Felly, mi fydd gennym nodyn ar hwnnw byddwn ni'n ei gyhoeddi cyn bo hir. A hefyd mae prentisiaethau yn faes arall rydym ni'n rhoi sylw iddo fo ar hyn o bryd. Ac wedyn, maes o law, rydym ni'n hapus iawn i rannu'r wybodaeth yna efo chi fel pwyllgor.

Mr Sion: Sorry, just on that point very quickly, we are in the process of drawing up briefing notes for the early years sector. So, we will have a note on that that we will be publishing soon. And also apprenticeships is another area that we are looking at at the moment. And, in due course, we'll be very happy to share that information with you as a committee.

[98] **Ms Huws:** Ac rydw i yn credu, o ran y maes addysg, mae yna drafodaethau eto yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd ynglŷn â sefydlu corff i oruchwylio addysg ôl-16. Rydw i'n credu ei fod yn aruthrol o bwysig ein

Ms Huws: And I do think, in terms of the education sector, there are discussions happening at the moment in terms of establishing a body to supervise post-16 education. I think it's extremely important that

bod ni'n manteisio ar y cyfle yna i we take advantage of that
 weu trafodaethau ynglŷn â'r Gymraeg opportunity to ensure discussions
 i ganol hynny. about the Welsh language are at the
 heart of this.

[99] Nid ydw i'n sicr eu bod nhw'n I don't think they're sitting at the
 eistedd ar ganol hynny ar hyn o bryd, heart of this at the moment, and I do
 ac felly, rydw i'n credu, eto, byddwn believe, again, that we will be
 ni'n ymateb i'r gwaith ymgynghori, responding to the consultation work
 a'r gwaith yn galw am dystiolaeth, and the call for evidence on that at
 sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd, ond the moment, but we can't lose that
 peidied â cholli'r cyfle. So, dyna faes opportunity. So, that is a policy area
 polisi lle nad oes rhwystredigaeth where there is no frustration but we
 ond mae angen i ni sicrhau bod y need to ensure that discussions
 trafodaethau ynglŷn â'r Gymraeg yn regarding the Welsh language are at
 ganolog. the core.

[100] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Lee **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you. Lee
 Waters. Waters.

[101] **Lee Waters:** I'd like to ask about complaints. I see that last year there
 were 112 complaints submitted by organisations implementing their Welsh
 language schemes. Is that 112 different people complaining, or is that 112
 complaints? Could you clarify that?

[102] **Ms Huws:** Cant a deuddeg o **Ms Huws:** One hundred and twelve
 gwynion. complaints.

[103] **Lee Waters.** Do you know how many individuals?

[104] **Ms Huws:** Ddim heb fynd yn ôl **Ms Huws:** Not without returning to
 i'r *records*. Mae modd—mi fuaswn i'n the records. We could find that
 gallu gwneud, ond nid ydw i'n information, but I don't have it
 gwybod fan hyn ar y foment. before me.

[105] **Lee Waters:** But do you have a sense? Is it a small number of people
 making repeated complaints or do—?

[106] **Ms Huws:** Ni fuasai'n deg, **Ms Huws:** I don't think it would be
 rwy'n credu, i fi ymateb heb fy mod fair for me to respond without
 i'n mynd yn ôl i tsiecio ar y record, checking the record, but I can

ond mi allaf i ddarparu'r wybodaeth yna, wrth gwrs. provide you with that information, of course.

[107] **Lee Waters:** If you could check, I think that's a significant point.

[108] **Ms Huws:** Gwnaf. **Ms Huws:** I will do.

[109] **Lee Waters:** That would be useful, thank you very much. We've discussed before your thoughts that the current process was overly bureaucratic in that the way the legislation was drawn up forces you to act in a particular way. I've certainly spoken to Welsh language officers in local authorities, for example, who feel that the process is more long winded than it needs to be. For example, they say that, if a complaint is received, you do an initial—correct me if I've misunderstood the process—but you do an initial inquiry as to whether or not you want to launch an investigation. They have to then fill in the whole range of forms. You then always come back and say, 'We are going to launch an investigation,' and the feeling is that you could get rid of that first stage altogether and just go straight into an investigation.

[110] So, in terms of your resources—because you've stressed in your report and in your evidence that you are stretched—do you feel that, in simplifying the process, a more efficient way of investigating can be carried out?

[111] **Ms Huws:** Yn sicr, rŷm ni wedi tynnu sylw—ac rydym wedi sôn wrthoch chi o'r blaen ynglŷn â'r problemau sy'n codi, neu'r problemau sy'n cael eu creu gan natur y ddeddfwriaeth sydd yn golygu nad yw'n bosib mynd i lawr y llwybr o ddatrysiadau buan, sydd yn safonol, erbyn hyn, mewn gwaith delio â chwynion. **Ms Huws:** Certainly, we have highlighted—and I've talked to you in the past about the problems that have arisen, or have been created by the nature of the legislation that mean that it's not possible to go down the route of early resolution, which is standard now, in terms of dealing with complaints.

[112] Ond fe gawsom gyngor cyfreithiol gan y Llywodraeth ar ddechrau gweithredu'r Mesur yn dweud nad oedd hynny'n bosib o fewn y system ddeddfwriaethol oedd gyda ni. Pe baem ni'n cael y gallu a'r disgrisiwn i gynnal y math yna o But we were given legal advice by the Government as we started to implement the Measure that that wasn't possible within the legislative framework that we had. Now, if we had that ability and discretion to undertake those kinds of processes, I

brosesau, buaswn i'n croesawu hynny. Buasai hynny'n datrys cymaint o sefyllfaoedd lle mae'r sefydliad, o bosib, yn dweud 'iawn', ond eto, ar adegau, mae'n rhaid i ni fynd trwy'r broses lawn. Rŷm ni wedi gweithredu'r broses gwynion yma nawr am gyfnod o 18 mis, o dan y ddeddfwriaeth yn llawn, ac, o edrych ar y data ddoe, 43 y cant o'r cwynion sydd yn cyrraedd ein sefydliad ni sy'n arwain at ymchwiliad.

would welcome that. That would resolve so many situations where an organisation says 'fine', but we still, at times, have to go through the full process. We've implemented this complaints process now for a period of 18 months, under the full legislation, and, in looking at the data yesterday, 43 per cent of the complaints submitted to our organisation actually lead to an inquiry.

[113] So, felly, mae'r pictiwr yma ein bod ni'n mynd lawr llwybr ymchwiliadau ar bob cais sydd yn dod i mewn ddim yn wir. Mae gyda ni ffigurau nawr ar sail gweithredu'r ddeddfwriaeth. So, 43 y cant sy'n mynd lawr y llwybr ymchwiliadau. Wedi mynd trwy'r broses ridyllu fanwl, rydym yn gofyn cwestiynau fel, 'A oes yna safon wedi ei dorri fan hyn?' Os nad oes, nid oes lle i gynnal cwyn. A ydy e'n rhesymol? A ydy e'n gymesur i fynd lawr llwybr ymchwiliadau? Felly, mae yna broses ridyllu hyd yn oed gyda'r system sydd gyda ni, ond os oes yna ddeddfwriaeth newydd i ddod, mi fuasai cael disgresiwn, mwy o hyblygrwydd a mwy o adnoddau i ddelio gyda chwynion mewn ffyrdd gwahanol i'w gwerthfawrogi.

So, this picture that we are always taking that inquiry approach, in terms of all complaints received, isn't the case. We do have some figures to prove that now. So, it's 43 per cent that go down that route. Having gone through a very detailed process in terms of assessing these, we ask questions such as, 'Has a standard been broken?' If not, there is no reason to uphold a complaint. Is it reasonable? Is it proportionate to go down the route of holding an inquiry? So, there is a process where we fine-tune this, even within the system that we already have, but if there is to be new legislation, then having discretion, greater flexibility and more resources to deal with complaints in different ways would be appreciated.

[114] **Lee Waters:** So, you've expressed your anxieties about the changes to the legislation the Government's going to bring about, but there could well be some upsides, some advantages and some efficiencies, too. Okay, thank you. In terms of the investigations that you've initiated yourself—. I can't find the figure in front of me now. There is a small number of investigations that you've triggered yourself. Can you tell me a little bit about the process of

how you decide to do that, what happens and what the outcomes have been?

[115] **Ms Huws:** Rwyf wedi sôn yn gynt ynglŷn â gweld cwynion o fath tebyg yn dod trwyddo o sawl gwahanol le, a'r hyn y gwnaethom ni benderfynu, yn arbennig gydag un maes lle roedd yna gwynion ynglŷn â gwersi nofio yn dod trwyddo o sawl gwahanol gyfeiriad, oedd yn hytrach na delio â nhw i gyd yn unigol, oedd delio â nhw fel un ymchwiliad. Felly, yn hytrach nag agor 22 o ymchwiliadau posibl, fe wnaethom ni benderfynu peidio gwneud hynny a delio â'r cwestiwn o wersi nofio trwy un broses ymchwiliad y gwnaethom ni ei hagor. Canlyniad hynny oedd gallu mynd trwy broses lle, ar ddiwedd y dydd, roeddwn i'n gallu cynnig cyngor i awdurdodau lleol yn eu cyfanrwydd ynglŷn â sut roedd modd iddyn nhw weithredu o fewn y safon. So, dyna'r math o sefyllfa lle fuaswn i, yn hytrach na mynd lawr sawl llwybr ymchwilio, yn gwneud penderfyniad i gynnal un er mwyn ateb problem a oedd yn systemig neu'n sectorol.

Ms Huws: I mentioned earlier about seeing similar complaints coming through from a number of different places, and what we decided, in particular with one area where complaints were coming through regarding swimming lessons from many directions, rather than dealing with all of them individually, was to deal with them as one investigation. So, rather than opening 22 possible investigations, we decided not to do that and dealt with the question of swimming lessons through one investigations process that we opened. The result of that was being able to go through the process where, at the end of the day, we could offer advice to local authorities as a whole about how they could operate within the standard. So, that is the sort of situation, rather than going down many routes of investigation, where we would hold one investigation in order to answer a problem that was systemic or sectoral.

[116] **Lee Waters:** And what's been the outcome of that in terms of that specific example of swimming lessons?

[117] **Ms Huws:** Rydym wedi cynnig cyngor a chymorth i sefydliadau i roi cynllun gweithredu yn ei le, a rhoi cyfarwyddyd iddyn nhw ar sut allu gwneud hynny, er mwyn osgoi y sefyllfa lle mae yna gwynion yn dod mewn yn y dyfodol.

Ms Huws: We have given advice and support to organisations to put an action plan in place, and to give them guidance on how to do that, in order to avoid a situation where complaints come in in the future.

[118] **Lee Waters:** What's been the outcome in terms of the real world impact that has had? Are there now Welsh-speaking swimming lessons?

[119] **Ms Huws:** Mae'r awdurdodau **Ms Huws:** Local authorities have lleol wedi derbyn y cyngor yna, ac mi accepted that advice, and I would fuaswn i'n gobeithio—. Nid wyf yn hope—. I don't think we've had a credu bod yna gwyn ynglŷn â gwersi complaint about swimming lessons nofio wedi dod mewn oddi ar hynny. since then.

[120] **Lee Waters:** Have there been any significant challenges or failures from the process—frustrations you've come across where your intervention hasn't brought about the desired outcome you wanted?

[121] **Ms Huws:** Rwy'n credu ei fod **Ms Huws:** It's fair to say that it's still yn deg i ddweud ei fod yn dal yn early days, but through and through ddyddiau cynnar, ond drwyddi draw the process and our relationship with mae'r broses ac mae'n ymwneud ni, the WLGA specifically, because they ein trafodaethau ni, gyda'r WLGA yn have gone through this process the benodol, oherwydd mai nhw sydd longest, and the feedback that we're wedi mynd drwy'r broses yma hiraf, getting from them are positive; they a'r adborth rydym yn ei gael oddi see that the system is working. It has wrthyn nhw yn bositif, eu bod nhw yn taken time to settle, but it is working gweld bod y system yn gweithio. Mae and it is leading to change. It has wedi cymryd amser i setlo, ond meant that they can see where the mae'n gweithio ac mae'n arwain at weaknesses arise. So, I do see newid. Mae'n golygu eu bod nhw yn complaints as being useful in order gallu gweld lle mae'r gwendidau yn for progress to be made codi. Felly, rwyf yn gweld cynwion yn gallu bod yn ddefnyddiol er mwyn gwella.

[122] **Lee Waters:** Sure. That wasn't quite the question I was trying to get at. Have there been any failures, challenges or frustrations you've had from the process, where it hasn't brought the outcome you've wanted?

[123] **Ms Huws:** Rwy'n credu mai un **Ms Huws:** I think one area where maes lle mae yna rwystredigaeth there is a general frustration, and gyffredinol, ac un eto lle rydym ni one that we've identified through wedi'i adnabod drwy gwynion, yw complaints, is difficulties arising with anawsterau sy'n codi gyda organisations in registering language sefydliadau wrth gofrestru dewis of choice. The public were asking,

iaith. Roedd y cyhoedd yn gofyn, 'Pam ydw i'n gorfod cofrestru fy newis iaith bob tro rwy'n cysylltu â gwahanol adran o'r cyngor yma?' Yn hytrach nag eto, rhwystredigaeth cyffredinol, yr hyn wnaethom ni benderfynu gwneud yn y maes yna oedd edrych ar hon fel problem systemig, rhoi swyddog yn ei le nid i ddelio â'r cwynion, ond i ddelio â'r broblem, ac rydym ni nawr yn gweithio gyda'r awdurdodau lleol a'r byrddau iechyd ynglŷn â chreu meddalwedd a ffyrdd o allu cofrestru dewis iaith dim ond unwaith. Un o'r pethau sydd wedi deillio o hynny yw trafodaeth ynglŷn a chael cofrestr y dinesydd, lle rydych chi ond yn cofrestru unwaith efallai mewn bywyd mai eich dewis iaith chi yw y Gymraeg. Mae modd—mae'r bobl sy'n deall technoleg gwybodaeth yn dweud bod yna fodd gwneud hynny dros amser. So, nid wyf yn gweld y system gwynion yn creu rhwystredigaethau mawr. Mae'n rhoi tystiolaeth gadarn i ni o le mae yna waith i'w wneud, ac yn aml iawn, rydym ni'n gwneud hynny ar y cyd.

'Why do I have to register my language of choice every time I contact different departments of this council?' Again, rather than it being a general frustration, what we decided to do in that area was to look at this as a systemic problem. We had an officer not to deal with the complaints, but to deal with the problem, and we are now working with local authorities and the health boards in order to create software and a means of registering a language of choice just once. One of the things that has come out of this is a discussion about a citizen's register, where you just register perhaps once in a lifetime that your language of choice is Welsh. People who understand IT tell me that there is a way of doing this over time. So, no, I don't see the complaints procedure creating many frustrations. It gives us strong evidence of where there is work to be done, and very often, we do that jointly.

[124] Yr adborth rydym ni'n ei gael wrth awdurdodau lleol yn benodol yw, 'Ocê, mae'r system yn drafferthus, ond rydych chi wedi ein helpu ni i adnabod gwendid.' Ond, fe af i yn ôl at yr hyn a ddywedais i, pe bai yna fodd cyrraedd y pwynt yna heb orfod mynd drwy'r broses sydd wedi cael ei gosod allan gan y Ddeddf, buasai i'w groesawu.

The feedback we get from local authorities specifically is, 'Okay, the system is troublesome, but you have helped us to recognise a weakness.' But, I'll go back to what I said, if there was a way of reaching that point without having to go through the process that has been set out in legislation, I would welcome that.

[125] **Lee Waters:** Diolch.

Lee Waters: Thank you.

[126] **Bethan Jenkins:** Neil Hamilton.

[127] **Neil Hamilton:** You spoke earlier on about your aspirations for the promotional work of your office and your frustration at not being able to do more because you haven't got the budget. Thirty-three organisations in the private and third sectors last year submitted progress plans to you, and 90 are in the process of preparing such plans. How are you going to measure progress in this area in the future, given the budgetary constraints on you? This is not going to be easy, I presume.

[128] **Ms Huws:** Fe wnaif i ddechrau ac fe eelli di ddod mewn. Fe allem ni jest cymryd niferoedd y busnesau sydd wedi cyflawni cynllun hybu. I fi, mae hynny yn bwysig, ond hefyd mae'n noeth iawn fel targed. Rwy'n credu bod angen i ni edrych ar brofiad y sefydliad, a dyna pam rydym ni'n gwerthfawrogi gweithio drwy'r cyrff ymbarél, oherwydd maen nhw'n gallu casglu ymateb sefydliadau.

Ms Huws: Shall I start, then you can come in? We could just look at the numbers of businesses that have delivered a progress plan. For me, that's important, but it's also very bare as a target. I think we need to look at the organisational experience, and that's why we appreciate working through the umbrella organisations, because they can gather the response of organisations.

[129] Er enghraifft, rydym ni'n gweithio nawr gyda'r consortiwm manwerthu yng Nghymru—y *retail consortium* yng Nghymru—ac maen nhw wedyn yn gallu casglu ymateb sefydliadau ar draws, yn ansoddol ac yn feintiol, a rhannu hynny gyda ni. Felly, mae yna dargedau meintiol, ond rwy'n credu, i fi, profiad y sefydliad, ac i fi hefyd, profiad y defnyddiwr.

For example, we are now working with the retail consortium in Wales, and they can then gather the responses of their member organisations, in a quantitative and qualitative way, and share that with us. So, there are quantitative targets, but for me it's the organisational experience and the user experience that are important.

[130] Ni wnaif ddweud ei fod yn codi fy nghalon i, ond pan rwy'n clywed pobl yn protestio ynglŷn â chorff fel Sports Direct yn ymddwyn mewn

I won't say that it lifts my spirits, but when I hear people protesting about a body such as Sports Direct behaving in a specific manner, then

ffordd benodol, i fi, mae hynny'n fethiant ar un lefel o ran y corff, ond mae'n braf clywed llais y bobl yn dweud, 'Nid yw hyn yn dderbyniol rhagor.' Felly, rwy'n credu ein bod ni'n casglu'r wybodaeth yna i gyd ac yn ceisio ei ddeall.

for me that's a failing on one level for that organisation, but it's good to hear the voice of the citizen saying that this is no longer acceptable. So, I do think that we are gathering all of that information and trying to understand it.

[131] **Mr Sion:** Jest un sylw i ychwanegu at hynny. Mae'r cwestiwn yn amserol iawn mewn gwirionedd. Rydym ni yn y broses ar hyn o bryd o gychwyn project i adolygu effaith ein gwaith hybu ni—felly, y gwaith rydym ni'n gwneud efo'r trydydd sector ac efo'r sector breifat hefyd. Felly, bydd yr adolygiad yna'n digwydd eleni ac yn dod i ben ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol. Wedyn, mi fyddwn ni'n dadansoddi hynny, ac os oes angen wedyn, yn newid rhai o'n gweithgareddau hefyd. Felly, mae yna adolygiad yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

Mr Sion: Just one comment to add to that. The question is very timely, really. We are in the process at the moment of starting a project to review the impact of our promotion work—so, the work we do with the third sector and with the private sector also. So, that review will happen this year and will come to an end at the end of the financial year. Then, we will analyse that, and if there's a need, we will change some of our activities as well. So, a review is being undertaken at the moment.

[132] **Neil Hamilton:** Do you think that there is any visible sign of people who don't have legal obligations to move in the direction that we want, that you're not having to drag so many, but they're coming with you quite naturally, taking the initiative themselves?

[133] **Ms Huws:** Fel y dywedais i yn y rhagair i'r adroddiad blynyddol, mae'r cwestiwn wedi newid yn sylfaenol. Erbyn hyn, nid yw'r sector busnes yn gofyn, 'Pam?', maen nhw'n gofyn, 'Sut?' 'Sut ydw i'n mynd i ddarparu gwasanaethau yn ddwyieithog? Sut mae hynny'n edrych i fi?' Mae hynny, buaswn i'n dweud, wedi digwydd yn ystod y ddegawd ddiwethaf yma. Rydym ni'n ei weld ar lawr gwlad o ran ein strydoedd ni.

Ms Huws: As I said in the foreword to the annual report, the question has fundamentally changed. Now, the business sector is not asking, 'Why?', they're asking, 'How?' 'How am I going to provide services bilingually? What does that look like to me?' I would say that that's happened over the past decade. We see it on the ground in terms of our high streets. We hear it more and more—we hear the Welsh language being used in

Rydym ni'n ei glywed fwyfwy—y business, you hear the Welsh Gymraeg yn cael ei defnyddio mewn language being used in the city busnes, mewn siopau yng nghanol centre in Cardiff. You hear people Caerdydd. Rydych chi'n clywed pobl being called to the counter through yn cael eu galw i'r cownter trwy the medium of Welsh. I do believe gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, rwy'n that that culture has changed. credu bod y diwylliant yna wedi newid.

[134] Rydym ni'n ei weld gyda'r We see it with the supermarkets at archfarchnadoedd ar hyn o bryd. the moment. We've established a Rydym ni wedi sefydlu fforwm supermarkets forum, following a archfarchnadoedd, yn dilyn darn o piece of work that we carried out waith y gwnaethom ni yn gynharach earlier this year, or the end of last eleni, neu ddiwedd llynedd, ac mae'r year, and that forum is alive with fforwm yna'n byrlymu gyda syniadau. ideas. They are generating their own Maen nhw'n creu atebion eu hunain, solutions, and one of the things ac un o'r pethau sy'n braf yw eu bod that's great is that they all sit around nhw i gyd yn eistedd rownd ford ac, the table and they become wrth gwrs, maen nhw wedyn yn competitive. So, progress is made gystadleuol. Felly, mae yna dwf a naturally in that environment. chynnydd yn digwydd yn naturiol wedyn.

[135] Rydym ni wedi cael fforwm We have a similar forum with the tebyg gyda'r banciau, sydd a'u heriau banks, which have specific challenges penodol iawn eu hunain, ond eto, all of their own, but again, there is a mae yna awydd yna i ddatrys desire to resolve problems, but problemau, ond yn fwy na hynny, further to that, they see an economic gweld budd busnes economaidd i'r business benefit to the Welsh Gymraeg. Mae hynny wedi newid, language. That, I think, has changed. rydw i'n credu.

10:30

[136] Mae'r gwaith y mae'r The work that the Government is Llywodraeth yn ei wneud o ran bwyd doing in terms of food and drink, I a diod, rydw i'n credu, yn wych yn believe, is wonderful in raising that codi'r ymwybyddiaeth yna o sut y awareness of how the Welsh mae modd defnyddio'r Gymraeg i language can be used to brand and frandio, i farchnata ac er budd to market produce for economic

economaidd, ac rydw i'n credu efallai fod hynny'n un o'r meysydd—roeddech chi'n holi pa feysydd polisi y gallem ni wneud mwy o waith ynddyn nhw—ac rydw i'n credu bod yna le i wneud mwy o waith o ran budd economaidd y Gymraeg. Mae'n waith sy'n cael ei wneud yn yr Alban. Maen nhw wedi datblygu'r gwaith yna yn eang o ran rhoi gwerth ar y cynnyrch Cymraeg a'r bunt Gymraeg.

benefit, and I think that's one of the areas—you were asking what policy areas we could do more work in—and I think there is room to do more work in terms of the economic benefit of the Welsh language. It is work that's done in Scotland. They have developed that quite broadly in terms of placing a value on Welsh produce and the Welsh pound.

[137] **Neil Hamilton:** Looking back over the last five years as a guide to what might happen in the next five years, do you have any regrets about the way you have made progress? Is there any more that now, in hindsight, you would have done in any particular area, or would you have done something differently? This isn't meant as a kind of criticism or an invitation to self-criticism, but we can all look back and think, 'Well, if I had done this in another way, which wasn't obvious at the time, then we might have made more progress here or there.'

[138] **Ms Huws:** Rydw i'n gobeithio ein bod ni'n sefydliad sydd yn dysgu, ac rydw i'n credu—ac mae Dyfan wedi cyfeirio ato fe yn gynt—fod y ffordd rŷm ni'n gweithio gyda sefydliadau sydd yn dod o dan y gyfundrefn safonau wedi newid. Wrth inni osod safonau ar y dechrau, roeddem ni'n lot mwy ffurfiol—hyd braich—oddi wrth sefydliad, efallai'n trafod llai'n wyneb yn wyneb, yn gweithredu mewn ffordd lot mwy seiliedig ar bapur. Mae hynny wedi newid, ac mae'r berthynas, o ganlyniad, gyda'r cyrff newydd sydd yn dod o wahanol sectorau yn berthynas wahanol. Erbyn hyn, rydw i'n credu ein bod ni wedi adfer perthynas iach gyda'r awdurdodau lleol, ac rydw i'n ddiolchgar iawn i'r

Ms Huws: I hope that we're a learning organisation and—Dyfan has referred to this earlier—the way in which we work with organisations that are captured under the standards regime has changed. As we imposed standards initially, we were far more formal—arm's length—in our approach to organisations. Perhaps we discussed issues less on a face-to-face basis. We were far more paper-based. That has changed, and the relationship with these new organisations in various sectors captured under standards is a different relationship. I think that we have, now, restored a healthy relationship with local authorities, and I'm very grateful to the WLGA for the work that we've done jointly with

WLGA am y gwaith rŷm ni'n ei wneud them.
ar y cyd.

[139] Felly, gobeithio ein bod ni'n dysgu, ond mae pum mlynedd yn amser byr mewn hanes iaith leiafrifol. Rydw i'n credu bod yna gymaint mwy inni ei gyflawni eto, a dim ond dechrau ydym ni ar y daith yma, o ran safonau, o ran deddfwriaeth ac o ran statws swyddogol i'r Gymraeg hefyd.

So, I hope that we are learning, but five years is a very brief period of time in the history of a minority language. I do think that there is so much more for us to achieve, and we are just beginning on this journey, in terms of standards and legislation and in terms of the official status of the Welsh language too.

[140] **Neil Hamilton:** Thank you.

[141] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy, yn fras.

Bethan Jenkins: Jeremy, briefly.

[142] **Jeremy Miles:** Jest yn fyr, mae beth rŷch chi'n ei ddweud am y fforwm archfarchnadoedd yn galonogol iawn. A ydy pob archfarchnad yn perthyn i'r fforwm yna, achos mae patrwm gwahanol, onid oes e? Wrth gwrs, byddech chi'n gwybod.

Jeremy Miles: Briefly, what you were saying about the supermarket forum is very heartening. Does every supermarket belong to that forum, because there is a different pattern, isn't there, as you know?

[143] **Mr Sion:** Nid wyf yn sicr a ydy pob archfarchnad. Yn sicr—

Mr Sion: I'm not sure whether every supermarket is. Certainly—

[144] **Jeremy Miles:** Rwy'n meddwl y cadwyni mwyaf.

Jeremy Miles: I'm talking about the biggest chains.

[145] **Mr Sion:** Ydyn, mae'r mwyafrif.

Mr Sion: Yes, the majority are.

[146] **Ms Huws:** Ydyn.

Ms Huws: Yes.

[147] **Mr Sion:** Mae'r un peth yn wir am y fforwm banciau hefyd, ond rydw i'n meddwl, fel y dywedodd Meri, mae yna awydd, mae yna

Mr Sion: The same is true about the banks forum, but as Meri said, there is a desire and enthusiasm to develop. The challenge is to ensure

frwdfrydedd i ddatblygu. Yr her ydy, wedyn, sicrhau bod hynny'n bwydo i lawr i'r canghennau unigol hefyd. Rydym ni'n dal i weld efo banciau, er enghraifft, fod yna broblemau'n codi, ond rydw i'n meddwl bod yn rhaid inni gychwyn efo'r fforymau cyffredinol, efo uwch swyddogion, a wedyn fod hynny'n—

that that permeates down to the individual branches. We still see with banks, for example, that problems do arise, but I do think that we have to start with the more general fora and with senior officials, and then that would permeate down.

[148] **Jeremy Miles:** Ac mae'r cwestiwn am y *roll-out* yn gwestiwn go iawn, ydyw e, beth sy'n digwydd ar lawr—? Y rheswm rwy'n gofyn y cwestiwn yw fy mod i'n gwybod am lot o ganghennau sydd ddim yn gwneud hynny, felly mae hynny'n rhan o'r broses fewnol sy'n broblem i'r archfarchnadoedd.

Jeremy Miles: And that question of roll-out is a real question, is it, what's happening at grass-roots—? The reason I'm asking the question is that I know about a number of branches that don't do that, so that is part of that internal process that's a problem for the supermarket.

[149] **Ms Huws:** O edrych ar y fforwm archfarchnadoedd, heb eu henwi nhw, mae'r cwmnïau traddodiadol y buasech chi wedi eu gweld ar y stryd fawr, ond sydd nawr yn y parciau ar ymyl y trefi, yna. Beth sydd wedi codi ein calonau ni yw bod y newydd-ddyfodiaid i'r farchnad yna hefyd.

Ms Huws: In looking the supermarket forum, without naming them, the traditional companies that you would have seen on the high street, but are now in retail parks out of town, are there. What's encouraged us is that the newcomers to the market are also there.

[150] **Jeremy Miles:** Reit, so dyna'r cwestiwn roeddwn i'n symud tuag ato fe.

Jeremy Miles: Right. That's the question I was getting to.

[151] **Ms Huws:** Nhw sydd wedi gwirfoddoli i fod yna. Mae'n nhw'n gweld gwerth, ac yn aml iawn, o fanna mae'r syniadau gwahanol yn deillio. Nhw sy'n meddwl y tu fas i'r bocs, yn aml.

Ms Huws: They have volunteered to be there. They see a value to it, and very often, that's where the new ideas emerge from. They think outside the box, very often.

[152] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ac i orffen, **Bethan Jenkins:** And finally, Hannah. Hannah.

[153] **Hannah Blythyn:** Diolch. Just very briefly, I want to touch on advertising. You developed and undertook two campaigns in 2016 and 2017: the rights to use the Welsh language and the individual's right to complain. I was wondering: how effective do you think those campaigns were, and in what way do you measure their success and whether they're value for money?

[154] **Ms Huws:** Dechreuia di. **Ms Huws:** You start.

[155] **Mr Sion:** O ran mesur, yn amlwg, ymgyrchoedd ydyn nhw i godi ymwybyddiaeth am ddarnau penodol o waith. Felly, beth rydym ni yn ei wneud i fesur ydy cynnal arolygon. Mae gennym ni gwestiynau rydym ni'n eu gofyn yn barhaol ynglŷn ag ymwybyddiaeth o waith y comisiynydd, ymwybyddiaeth o hawliau iaith, er enghraifft, a oedd yn gysylltiedig efo un ymgyrch. Felly, rydym ni'n gofyn cwestiynau mewn arolygon ac rydym ni'n gallu monitro wedyn sut mae'r canlyniadau yn cael eu heffeithio.

Mr Sion: In terms of measuring, they are, obviously, campaigns to raise awareness about specific areas of work. Therefore, what we're doing to measure these is we have surveys. We have questions that we ask continuously about awareness of the commissioner's work, awareness of language rights, for example, which was associated with one of the campaigns. So, we ask these questions in surveys and then we can monitor how the results are impacted.

[156] Jest yn gyflym o ran ymgyrchoedd hefyd, rydym ni'n mynd i barhau efo'r ymgyrch hawliau. Mae hwnnw'n rhywbeth rydym ni'n mynd i barhau efo, yn amlwg, achos rydym ni'n dal i osod safonau. Rydym ni'n ceisio gwneud y peth yn fwy cysylltiedig efo'r cyrff diwethaf rydym ni'n gweithio efo nhw hefyd. Felly, mi fydd yna ymgyrch efo prifysgolion a cholegau cyn bo hir. Rhywbeth arall rydym ni'n ceisio codi mwy o sylw iddo fo hefyd ydy'r cynllun iaith gwaith sydd gennym ni, sef y

Just quickly, on campaigns, we are going to continue with the rights campaign. That's something that we're going to continue with, clearly, because we're still imposing standards. We're trying to do this and associate it more with the bodies that we have been working with. So, there'll be a campaign with colleges and universities soon. Another aspect that we're trying to raise awareness of is the working Welsh scheme, that is, the badges that say that somebody can offer a service

bathodynau sydd yn nodi os ydy through the medium of Welsh.
rhywun yn gallu cynnig gwasanaeth
yn Gymraeg.

[157] **Ms Huws:** Ac, wrth gwrs, rydym ni'n edrych ar dueddiadau o ran trydar. Os oes yna ymgyrch wedi bod, gwnawn ni edrych ar a ydy patrymau trydar ac adborth o'r math yna wedi cynyddu. Mae tîm cyfathrebu bach gyda ni sy'n gwneud y math yna o waith ac yn ei fwydo fe trwyddo i ni fel tîm rheoli er mwyn i ni wneud penderfyniadau ar ydy e'n werth ei wneud.

Ms Huws: And, of course, we are looking at trends in terms of Twitter. If there has been a campaign we will look as to whether the Twitter feedback and that kind of feedback has increased. We have a small communications team carrying out that sort of work and feeding it through to us as a management team for us to make decisions as to whether that's worth while.

[158] **Hannah Blythyn:** Yes, I was going to ask—well, as a follow up, then—how you use digital technologies to maximise the reach of your campaigns. So, a very quick follow-up question: in terms of the surveys you carry out to see how successful something's been, how do you choose? How do you determine who you're going to survey and how do you do that?

[159] **Mr Sion:** O ran arolygon, rydym ni'n defnyddio cwmni allanol arbenigol, so, rydym ni'n eu comisiynu nhw i ofyn y cwestiynau ar ein rhan ni. Yr arolwg diweddaraf rydym ni'n ei ddefnyddio, arolwg omnibws ydy o, felly mae yna sampl o dua 500 yn fanna. So, maen nhw'n seiliedig ar samplau penodol, ond rydym ni'n defnyddio arbenigwyr i ofyn y cwestiynau. Rydym ni hefyd yn ceisio defnyddio rhai o'n fforymau ni hefyd, ac yn gofyn cwestiynau ar ffurf holiadur, sydd yn llai gwyddonol, ond mae yn rhoi mwy o wybodaeth ansoddol i ni weithiau.

Mr Sion: In terms of surveys, we use an external expert company, so we commission them to ask questions on our behalf. The latest survey we're using is an omnibus survey, so there is a sample of about 500 there. So, they are based on specific samples, but we use experts to ask the questions. We also try to use our forums as well, and we ask questions in the form of a questionnaire. It's not as scientific, but it does provide us with qualitative information.

[160] **Ms Huws:** Un darn o waith y byddwn ni yn ei wneud yn ystod y

Ms Huws: One piece of work we will be undertaking in this next period in

cyfnod nesaf o ran mesur ymateb, ac mae Dyfan wedi sôn amdano fe yn benodol, yw mynd ar ôl busnesau a mynd i'r Sioe Fawr, mynd i ffeiriau busnes, a chasglu gwybodaeth yn fanna—so, mewn sefyllfa lle na fuasech chi yn disgwyl Cymry Cymraeg yn unig i fod—er mwyn gweld i ba raddau mae'r negeseuon yn mynd allan i feysydd eraill.

terms of measuring response, and Dyfan has mentioned it specifically, is pursuing businesses and going to the Royal Welsh Show and to business fairs and gathering information there—so, in situations where you perhaps wouldn't expect there to be just Welsh speakers—to see to what extent those messages are permeating into other areas.

[161] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rydym ni yn cael seibiant o bum munud nawr i newid pwy sydd yn dod mewn i roi gwybodaeth, a byddwn ni'n ailddechrau wedyn. Diolch.

Bethan Jenkins: We're now going to have a break of five minutes to change the witnesses and we will restart then. Thank you.

[162] **Ms Huws:** Diolch.

Ms Huws: Thank you.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10:38 a 10:47.
The meeting adjourned between 10:38 and 10:47.*

Craffu Cyffredinol: Comisiynydd y Gymraeg—Adroddiad Sicrwydd General Scrutiny: Welsh Language Commissioner—Assurance Report

[163] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch, a chroeso nôl. Eitem 3 ar yr agenda yw gwaith craffu. Rydym ni'n cael Meri Huws yma eto, Comisiynydd y Gymraeg, Gwenith Price, cyfarwyddwr strategol, a Guto Dafydd, uwch swyddog cydymffurfio. Diolch yn fawr iawn i chi'ch dau am ymuno â ni. Eto, bydd yna gwestiynau ar themâu gwahanol. Y cwestiwn cyntaf sydd gen i yw: a ydych chi'n gallu ehangu ar brif ganfyddiadau'r adroddiad? Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi bod dangosyddion cynnar yn awgrymu bod profiad pobl o gyrchu a defnyddio gwasanaethau cyfrwng

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you, and welcome back. Item 3 on the agenda is scrutiny. We have Meri Huws, the Welsh Language Commissioner, with us again, Gwenith Price, the strategic director, and Guto Dafydd, senior compliance officer. Thank you very much to both of you for joining us. Again, there will be questions on different themes. The first question I have is on whether you can expand on the key findings of the report. The report notes that early indications suggest that people's experiences of accessing and using services through the medium of Welsh are improving.

Cymraeg yn gwella. A oes modd i chi jest ddweud yn gyffredinol, achos byddwn yn gofyn cwestiynau mewn mwy o fanylder yn y man, yn fras, beth rydych chi'n ei feddwl yn hynny o beth?

Could you just tell us in general, because we will be asking more detailed questions later, but, just generally, what you think of that aspect?

[164] **Ms Huws:** Ocê. Gwnaf i ddechrau. Dyma'r trydydd adroddiad sicrwydd i ni ei gyhoeddi, so, felly, mae beth sydd gyda ni fan hyn yn rhan o daith o fesur profiad defnyddwyr wrth bod safonau yn cael eu gweithredu. I fi, efallai mai hwn yw'r adroddiad pwysicaf rydym ni wedi ei gynhyrchu o ran adroddiadau sicrwydd, oherwydd dyma'r cyntaf oddi ar i safonau ddod yn weithredol gyda'r 26 cyntaf. So, rŷm ni'n mesur rhywbeth real fan hyn. Erbyn hyn, pe bawn i yn sgwennu adroddiad sicrwydd heddiw, mi fuasai 78 o sefydliadau o dan y safonau, ond, y 26 cyntaf, beth rŷm ni'n gweld yn bendant yw bod gwasanaethau rheng flaen y sefydliadau hynny wedi cryfhau yn sylweddol—o sôn am dderbynfeydd, o sôn am gyswllt ffôn, o sôn am brofiadau'r defnyddiwr cychwynnol yna wrth ymwneud â'r sefydliad, mae yna gynnydd, ac nid jest tamaid bach. Ar sail y gwaith siopwr cudd mae'r swyddogion wedi bod yn ei wneud, ar sail y gwaith arolygon, mae yna gynnydd sylweddol o ran hynny.

Ms Huws: Okay. I will start. This is the third assurance report that we've published, and what we have here is part of a journey in assessing user experience as standards are implemented. For me, this is perhaps the most important report that we've produced in terms of assurance reports, because this is the first since standards have been operational with the first 26. So, we are measuring something tangible here. If I were to write an assurance report today, there would be 78 organisations captured, but this covers the first 26. What we see most certainly is that front-line services of those organisations have improved significantly—looking at reception areas, phone contact, in talking about the initial user experience as they contact an organisation, progress has been made, and not just minor progress. On the basis of the mystery shopper work carried out by officers, on the basis of the surveys carried out, there is significant progress in that regard.

[165] Pam ydw i'n gweld hynny'n bwysig? Wel, rŷm ni wedi trafod lot yng Nghymru ynglŷn â'r cynnig rhagweithiol. Rŷm ni wedi bod yn sôn

Why do I believe that's important? In Wales, we've discussed the active offer a great deal. We've been talking about the active offer for decades in

am y cynnig rhagweithiol ers degawdau, ynglŷn â'r angen i ddefnyddiwr gael y sicrwydd yna wrth gerdded i fewn i sefydliad bod nhw'n mynd i gael cynnig gwasanaeth yn hytrach nag eu bod nhw'n gorfod gofyn. Rydw i yn credu ein bod ni yn gweld y cynnig rhagweithiol ar waith fan hyn. Rŷm ni'n dechrau gweld y shift yna o ran sefydliadau a phrofiad y defnyddiwr.

terms of the need for the service user to have that assurance as they walk into an organisation that they will be offered a service rather than having to ask for it. I do think that we are seeing the active offer at work here. We are starting to see that shift in terms of organisations and user experience.

[166] Rŷm ni'n edrych ar wefannau, ac rŷm ni'n gweld tudalennau *splash* Cymraeg fwyfwy. Grêt—neges glir yn mynd allan i'r cyhoedd, i ddefnyddwyr, bod y profiad yn gwella. Rŷm ni wedi gwneud gwaith o ran ymchwil gyda'r cyhoedd. Maen nhw'n dweud wrthym ni bod y profiad yn gwella, ac mae'r cyhoedd yn gallu bod yn feirniadol iawn, fel rŷm ni'n gwybod—rŷm ni wedi bod yn sôn am gwynion. Ond maen nhw'n dweud eu bod nhw nawr yn gweld gwella ar lawr gwlad.

In looking at websites, we see Welsh language splash pages far more often, which is wonderful. It's a clear message conveyed to the public and to service users that the experience is improving. We've done work in terms of research with the public and they tell us that the experience is improving, and the public can be very critical, as we know—we've talked about complaints. But they are telling us that they are now seeing the progress on the ground.

[167] Y peth diwethaf rydw i'n mynd i sôn amdano o ran y prif ganfyddiad yna bod yna newid—llynedd, pan wnaethom ni gyhoeddi'r ail adroddiad sicrwydd, roeddem ni wedi edrych, fel rŷm ni'n ei wneud yn flynyddol, ar hysbysebion swyddi yn y sector gyhoeddus dros gyfnod o dri mis, ac edrych ar filoedd o hysbysebion swyddi. Flwyddyn yn ôl, 11 o'r 22 awdurdod lleol oedd yn cynnal unrhyw fath o ymarferiad o ran edrych ar anghenion sgiliau ieithyddol o fewn swyddi. Y tro yma,

The last thing I want to mention in terms of the main finding that there has been a change—last year, when we published the second assurance report, we had looked, as we do on an annual basis, at job advertisements in the public sector over a period of three months; we looked at thousands of job advertisements. A year ago, 11 of the 22 local authorities had carried out any sort of exercise in terms of looking at the linguistic skills needs for posts. This time, 22 are doing so.

mae 22 yn ei wneud. So, pob un o'r awdurdodau lleol, maen nhw'n mynd trwy ymarferiad wrth hysbysebu swydd o edrych ar—a gwneud hynny'n rheolaidd—beth yw'r sgiliau ieithyddol sydd eu hangen fan hyn.

So, each of the local authorities is carrying out an exercise in advertising posts where they look at what the linguistic needs are for those post, and they do that regularly.

[168] Rŷm ni wedi gweld cynnydd bach—ddim anferth, ond cynnydd bach—o ran y nifer o swyddi sydd â Chymraeg yn hanfodol. Rŷm ni'n gweld cynnal y rhai delfrydol, ond beth rydw i'n gwerthfawrogi yw bod yna fwy o feddwl wedi mynd i mewn i'r ymarferiad, bod swyddogion adnoddau dynol—. Dylwn i ddweud, yn dilyn cyhoeddi'r adroddiad llynedd, gwnaethom ni gynnal cyfres o sesiynau â swyddogion adnoddau dynol ar draws Cymru, sesiynau hyfforddiant a sesiynau briffio. Gallwn ni gymryd tipyn bach o'r clod am hynny, ond iddyn nhw mae'r clod. Maen nhw wedi ymateb, ac rŷm ni'n gweld cynnydd.

We have seen a small increase—not a huge increase, but a small increase—in the number of posts that are Welsh essential. We see a maintaining of the situation too, but what I appreciate is that more thought has been put into this exercise, that HR officers—. I should say, following on from the publication of last year's report, we carried out a series of sessions with HR officials across Wales. They were training sessions and briefing sessions. We can take some of the praise for that, but the praise should go to them. They've responded, and we are seeing progress.

[169] Rŷm ni'n sôn am weithlu—rŷm ni wedi trafod anghenion gweithlu mewn gwahanol sefyllfaoedd. Rŷm ni'n dechrau gweld y camau bach yna yn cael eu cymryd i lenwi bylchau, adnabod lle mae bylchau, ac adnabod lle mae angen—

We've discussed workforce needs in various circumstances and situations. We are starting to see those small steps being taken in order to fill the gaps, to identify the gaps and to identify where there is need—

[170] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae gan Jeremy gwestiwn, os mae'n iawn.

Bethan Jenkins: Jeremy has a question, if that is all right.

[171] **Ms Huws:** Océ. Sori.

Ms Huws: Okay. Sorry.

[172] **Jeremy Miles:** Jest cwestiwn cyffredinol. Diolch am yr adroddiad.

Jeremy Miles: Just a general question. Thank you for the report. There are a

Mae lot o ystadegau calonogol iawn ar draws ystod eang o fathau o ddarpariaeth. Beth wnes i ddim ei weld oedd ystadegau ynglŷn â'r dewisiadau mae unigolion yn eu gwneud pan fo ganddyn nhw ddewis. Hynny yw, mae'r ystadegau'n cael eu cyfeirio tuag at y ddarpariaeth, ac mae hi'n ehangu mewn lot fawr o ffyrdd, neu'r gallu i ymateb i alwad yn y Gymraeg, er enghraifft. Ond nid oeddwn i'n gweld ystadegau ynglŷn â faint o bobl sy'n dewis gwneud galwad yn y Gymraeg, neu faint o bobl sydd yn dewis mynd ar dudalen ar y we. Efallai fy mod i wedi ei golli fe. A ydych chi'n casglu'r ystadegau hynny hefyd—hynny yw, newid ymddygiad, newid dewisiadau unigolion yn ieithyddol?

lot of very encouraging statistics around a wide range of types of provision. But what I didn't see were statistics relating to the choices that people make when they have a choice. That is, the statistics referred to the provision, and it is expanding in many ways, or the ability to respond to a call through the medium of Welsh, for example. But I couldn't see any statistics relating to the number of people who decide to make a call through the medium of Welsh, or how many people decide to go on to a Welsh language webpage. I may have missed that. Do you collect those statistics as well—that is, behavioural change or a change in people's linguistic choices?

[173] **Ms Price:** Nid ydym ni wedi gwneud yn yr ymarferiad yma. Bob blwyddyn, rydym ni'n dewis themâu—yn ogystal â mesur rhai pethau craidd, rydym ni'n dewis themâu. Rydym ni wedi mynd ar ôl, eleni, yr egwyddor arall sydd yn y Mesur o hybu a hyrwyddo—cynnig y dewis. Felly, beth oeddem ni eisiau ei wybod yn y man cyntaf, achos mae hi'n gynnar, ydy—mae'r driniaeth gyfartal yn llai ffafriol; mae yna egwyddor newydd yn y Mesur o hybu a chynyddu defnydd. Roeddem ni eisiau edrych yn gyntaf ar i ba raddau mae'r sefydliadau wedi anwesu'r egwyddor yna fod yna newid yn digwydd yn y fanna. Felly, mi gychwynnom ni drwy fynd at sefydliadau i wneud arolygon, i

Ms Price: We haven't done so as part of this exercise. Every year, we choose themes—in addition to some core measurements, we chose themes. This year, we pursued the other principle in the Measure of promoting and facilitating—offering the choice. So, what we wanted to know initially, because it is at an early stage, is—equal treatment is less favourable; there's a new principle in the Measure of increasing and encouraging use. We wanted to look initially at the extent to which the organisations have embraced that principle that there was change happening there. So, we started by going to institutions to carry out surveys, to discuss with them, to seek examples of how they are

drafod â nhw, i chwilio am enghreifftiau o sut maen nhw'n dechrau gwneud hyn a hefyd canolbwyntio'n arolygon ar y cynnig, y bathodyn, y ffôn, i weld a ydy o'n *robust*, a ydy pethau'n dechrau newid.

starting to do this. We focused our surveys on the offer, the badge, the telephone, to see whether it's robust and whether change is starting to happen.

[174] Beth rydym ni'n ei wneud yn sgil y canfyddiadau rŵan ydy cynnal gweithdai eleni ar hyn, sef hybu. Rydym ni wedi gwahodd pobl ym maes gofal cwsmer, cyfathrebu a marchnata, swyddogion iaith, chyfarwyddwyr, os ydyn nhw'n dymuno, i ddod i weithdai i edrych ar y cwestiwn, 'Beth ydy'r rhwystrau o ran defnydd? Beth mae pobl yn ei feddwl pan fyddan nhw'n dod at sefydliadau? Beth ydy'r rhwystrau hanesyddol a'r meddylfryd?', ond hefyd beth allan nhw ei wneud i feithrin a chynyddu defnydd. Felly, dyna'r nod.

What we're doing as a result of those findings now is holding workshops this year on this issue of promotion. We've invited people from the area of customer care, communications, marketing, language officers, directors, if they wish to do so, to come to workshops to look at what are the barriers in terms of language use, what people's perception is when they approach organisations, what are the historic barriers and the mindset, but also what can they do to nurture and encourage use. So, that's the aim.

[175] **Jeremy Miles:** So, felly, nid ydych chi, o fewn yr adroddiad hwn, wedi casglu'r data yna.

Jeremy Miles: So, therefore, within this report, you haven't collected that data.

[176] **Ms Price:** Dim eleni, na.

Ms Price: Not this year, no.

[177] **Jeremy Miles:** Reit. So, jest i orffen y pwynt yma, er enghraifft, pan fydddech chi'n edrych ar allu cyngor lleol i ddarparu gwasanaeth Cymraeg dros y ffôn, mae gyda chi *cohort* o bobl sydd yn moyn siarad yn Gymraeg ar y ffôn ac mae gyda chi ddadansoddiad o'r gallu i ddarparu hynny. Ym mha ffordd ŷch chi'n gwybod beth yw'r gallu i ddarparu os

Jeremy Miles: Right. So, just to finish this point, for example, when you look at the capacity of a local council to provide a Welsh language service on the phone, you have a cohort of people who want to speak Welsh on the phone, and you have an analysis of that capacity to provide that. How do you know what that capacity to provide is unless you know the size

nad ŷch chi'n gwybod beth yw maint of that cohort?
y cohort?

[178] **Ms Price:** Rydym ni'n gweithio efo'r sefydliadau. Felly, i roi un enghraifft i chi, mae gennym ni lyfrgell arferion llwyddiannus ar ein gwefan. Mae cyngor Caerfyrddin yn ystod y flwyddyn yn un sefydliad sydd wedi gwneud y gwaith hybu, hyrwyddo, casglu. Dim ond 18 mis sydd, ac yn y cyfnod yna, nid ydyn nhw eto wedi cael y data ynghyd i allu gwneud beth rydych chi'n holi amdano fo. Ac felly, ein nod ni drwy wneud y gweithdai yma ydy cyrraedd pwynt lle ein bod ni'n gallu gwneud y cyswllt rhwng bod y cyfle yna ac ein bod ni'n gallu meithrin defnydd—creu cwsmer, os ydych chi'n licio.

Ms Price: We work with these organisations. To give you one example, we have a library of good practice on our website. Carmarthenshire council is one institution that has done this work of promoting and gathering evidence. It's been 18 months, and in that period they haven't yet gathered the data in order to do what you're requesting. So, our aim, in carrying out these workshops is to get to a point where we can make that connection between the opportunity being in place and that we can nurture usage—generate custom, if you like.

[179] Yn hynny o beth, rydw i'n gwybod roedd Meri yn sôn yn y cyfarfod blaenorol am yr anhawster yma o gofnodi dewis iaith. Rydym ni hefyd wedi dysgu bod hwn yn rhywbeth pwysig, er ei fod o'n anodd. Mae o'n help yn enwedig i siroedd mewn ardaloedd lleiafrifol lle mae'n anoddach, efallai, i adnabod pwy ydy'r defnyddwyr a phwy sydd eisiau, i gael dull syml o gofnodi ac wedyn gallu adeiladu perthynas efo defnyddwyr a dros amser cyfoethogi'r profiadau yma, a'u bod nhw'n gweld y defnydd yn tyfu. Ond rydych chi'n sôn am newid arfer, ac nid ydw i'n meddwl ei fod yn bosib i ni jest mesur drwy ryw gip arolwg. Mae'n rhaid i ni weithio efo sefydliadau ac mae'n rhaid iddyn

In that regard, I know that Meri mentioned in your previous session this difficulty in recording language of choice. We've also learnt that this is something very important, albeit difficult. It is of assistance particularly in counties where the Welsh language is not with majority usage to identify those users, in order to have an easy way of recording language of choice and then building a relationship with service users over a period of time and enhancing their experiences over time, so that they see an increase in uptake. But you're talking about changing habits, and I don't think it's possible for us to measure that through a brief survey. We have to work with organisations and they, in

nhw, mewn ffordd, gwneud y mesur a rhannu gwybodaeth efo ni.

a way, have to assess that themselves and share that information with us.

[180] **Jeremy Miles:** A fyddai'n bosib, blwyddyn nesaf, petai chi'n dewis, er enghraifft, gwneud casglu data nid yn unig ar ddarpariaeth, ond y dewis ieithyddol mae unrhyw unigolyn yn ei wneud? A fyddai hynny'n bosib ei wneud?

Jeremy Miles: Would it be possible next year, if you chose to do it, for example, to collect data not only on the provision, but on the linguistic choice that an individual makes? Would it be possible to do that?

[181] **Ms Huws:** Fe wnaethom ni gynnal, nôl yn 2013, arolwg defnydd iaith ar y cyd gyda'r Llywodraeth—yn ddarn mawr o waith. Rydym ni newydd ddechrau trafod gyda'r Llywodraeth eto y budd o ailgynnal y math yna o waith ar lefel genedlaethol, ond hefyd wedyn mae modd i ni edrych ar ardaloedd, rhanbarthau, siroedd ac yn y blaen.

Ms Huws: Back in 2013 we carried out a language use survey jointly with the Government and that was a major piece of work. We have just started to discuss with the Government the benefit of restaging that kind of work at a national level, but we can also look at areas, regions, counties and so on.

[182] **Mr Dafydd:** Mae'r ystadegau o'r arolwg yna yn nodi bod pobl, yn gyffredinol, yn awyddus iawn fod y gwasanaethau ar gael, ond tua hanner sy'n dymuno defnyddio'r gwasanaethau yna, o siaradwyr Cymraeg. Mae gennym ni rywfaint o fanylder pellach. Er enghraifft, rydym ni'n gwybod os ydy pobl yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg bob dydd eu bod nhw'n llawer mwy tebygol o fynd at sefydliad a gofyn am wasanaeth Cymraeg. Rydym ni hefyd yn gwybod, os ydy pobl yn cael cynnig y gwasanaeth Cymraeg ar y cyfle cyntaf, maen nhw hefyd yn llawer mwy tebygol o ddefnyddio'r gwasanaeth Cymraeg.

Mr Dafydd: The statistics from that survey note that people in general are very keen that the services are available, but that only half of them wish to use those services, among Welsh speakers. We have some sort of further detail. For example, we know that if people are using the Welsh language every day that they are much more likely to go to an organisation and ask for a Welsh language service. We also know that if people are offered a Welsh language service at the first instance, they are then much more likely to use that Welsh language service.

[183] Mae'r canfyddiadau yna yn cael eu hategu gan waith ymchwil cynradd rydym ni wedi'i wneud eleni drwy arolwg omnibws, lle mae 97 y cant o bobl yn meddwl bod hawliau'n bwysig. Roedd canran llawer llai yn dymuno defnyddio'r gwasanaeth yna. Fe wnaethom ni hefyd eu holi nhw am y rhwystrau—gofyn iddyn nhw beth fuasai'n newid ei penderfyniad nhw. Maen nhw'n sôn am bethau fel hyder. Maen nhw'n sôn am bethau fel profiadau gwael blaenorol, ac mae hynny'n tanlinellu'r ffaith ein bod ni'n sôn am newid diwylliannol yn fan hyn, a beth rydym ni'n ei ategu yn y gweithdai ydy bod yna gyfrifoldeb ar y sefydliadau i annog y defnydd yna. Mae yna ddyletswydd penodol yn y safonau i hybu a hwyluso unrhyw wasanaeth Cymraeg maen nhw'n ei gynnig, ac rydym ni'n sôn am ddulliau codi ymwybyddiaeth fel mae sir Gaerfyrddin wedi gwneud: ymgyrch benodol yn nodi bod y gwasanaeth ar gael. Ond rydym ni hefyd yn sôn am gynllunio gwasanaeth fel bod y Gymraeg yn ddewis greddf, naturiol. Rydym ni'n sôn am dechnegau *nudge* ac yn y blaen, fel bod sefydliadau yn cael eu harfogi, eu bod nhw'n cael trafod dulliau o fod yn darparu gwasanaeth mewn ffordd sy'n cymell defnyddwyr i ddewis gwasanaeth Cymraeg.

Those findings are also emphasised in work that we've done this year in the omnibus survey, where 97 per cent of people think that rights are important, but a smaller percentage wish to use those services. We asked them about the barriers. We also asked them what would change their decision, and they talk about things such as confidence, bad experiences in the past, and that underlines the fact that we're talking about a cultural change here. What we emphasise in the workshops is that there's a responsibility on organisations to encourage that use. There is a specific duty in the standards to promote any sort of Welsh language service that they provide, and we're talking about raising awareness aspects, such as in Carmarthenshire, where they have conducted a specific campaign noting that the service is available. But we're also talking about the planning of a service, so that the Welsh language is the natural choice. We're talking about nudge techniques, for example, so that organisations have the tools and that they can discuss methods of providing a service that encourages users to use the Welsh language service.

[184] **Jeremy Miles:** Grêt, ocê, diolch yn fawr.

Jeremy Miles: Great, okay, thank you very much.

[185] **Bethan Jenkins:** Beth am canran y rhwystredigaethau? Achos

Bethan Jenkins: What about the percentage of frustrations? Because I

mae'n brofiad personol gen i; rydych chi'n cael cymaint o rhwystredigaethau lle rydych chi'n aros ar y lein neu rydych chi'n ceisio gwneud cais, a'r tro nesaf mae'n gallu gwneud i chi ailfeddwl gwneud y galwad hwnnw. A oes yna ganran penodol?

have personal experience of this; there are so many frustrations where you're left hanging on the telephone, trying to access a service, and it can make you rethink that choice of language in the future. Do you have any specific percentages?

[186] **Mr Dafydd:** Wel, buaswn i'n gallu ateb hynny drwy ddweud bod yna gynnydd wedi bod, gan sôn am yr arolygon rydym ni wedi'u cynnal yn 2015–16 ac y flwyddyn ddilynol. Rydych chi'n lot mwy tebygol o gael ymateb Cymraeg i ymholiad mewn derbynfa neu ar y ffôn, ac hefyd mae'r gwasanaeth yna'n cael ei gynnig i chi yn llawer cynharach yn y broses. Ond mae yna waith eto i'w wneud o ran sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth Cymraeg ar gael fel y dylai fe fod—edrych ar ohebiaeth, er enghraifft. Nid oedd ymateb i 31 y cant o'r ohebiaeth Gymraeg a gafodd ei hanfon at sefydliadau, a gohebiaeth Gymraeg ychydig bach yn llai tebygol na gohebiaeth Saesneg o gael ymateb.

Mr Dafydd: I could answer that by saying that there's been an increase in terms of the surveys we undertook in 2015–16 and the following year. You are much more likely to have a Welsh response to an enquiry in a reception or on the phone, and also that service is offered to you at a much earlier stage in the process. But work is yet to be done in terms of ensuring that the Welsh language service is available as it should be—for example, looking at correspondence. There was no response to 31 per cent of Welsh language correspondence that was sent to organisations, and Welsh language correspondence was slightly less likely to have a response than English correspondence.

11:00

[187] Edrych ar wefannau wedyn. Er ein bod ni wedi gweld cynnydd o ran y gwefannau cyngor sir oedd efo tudalen sblash yn cynnig gwasanaeth Cymraeg, a chynnydd hefyd o ran nifer y cyngorau sir oedd yn darparu pob un o'r tudalennau wnaethom ni ymweld â nhw yn Gymraeg, rydym ni'n gweld pethau o ran ansawdd.

Looking then at websites. Even though we've seen an increase in terms of the county council websites that had a splash page offering Welsh language services, and also an increase in the number of county councils that provided each one of the pages that we visited in Welsh, we are seeing things in terms of

Rydym ni'n gweld defnydd o bethau fel Google Translate. Rydym ni'n gweld, lle mae gennych chi wefan Gymraeg a Saesneg, a bod yna ddata, dyddiadau a manylion, fod y rheini'n dueddol o fod wedi dyddio yn Gymraeg o gymharu efo'r Saesneg, a bod problemau technegol yn fwy cyffredin ar yr ochr Gymraeg hefyd. quality. We're seeing the use of Google Translate. We're seeing, where you have a Welsh and English website and there are data, dates and details, those tend to be dated on the Welsh language site compared to the English site, and there are more technical problems on the Welsh side.

[188] Felly, er ein bod ni'n gweld gwelliant, a'n bod ni'n falch o weld hynny, mae yna'n dal waith pellach i'w wneud. So, even though we're seeing an improvement, and we're pleased to see that, there is still further work to be done.

[189] **Bethan Jenkins:** Hannah Blythyn.

[190] **Hannah Blythyn:** You just touched on, in that response to the Chair, the increase you've seen in terms of telephone calls being answered in Welsh—it's 20 per cent in the report. Do you attribute that to the implementation of standards, or do you think it's a range of factors?

[191] **Ms Huws:** Mae'r adborth rydym ni'n ei gael oddi wrth y sefydliadau, yr awdurdodau lleol, ar lefel sefydliadol yn eu hardaloedd ac ar lefel genedlaethol, yn dweud mai'r safonau sydd wedi gosod y ffordd iddyn nhw. **Ms Huws:** The feedback that we receive from organisations, the local authorities, at an institutional level in their areas and at the national level, tell us that it's the standards that have set the route-map for them.

[192] Y safonau, nid ydynt yn gymhleth, maen nhw'n syml iawn o ran gosod allan beth yw'r disgwyliadau ar sefydliad. Mae sefydliadau'n gwerthfawrogi hynny. Maen nhw'n gwybod beth sydd angen ei wneud i gyflawni. Ac felly, byddwn i'n dweud bod yna gysylltiad uniongyrchol rhwng y safonau a'r newid sydd wedi bod. The standards aren't complex. They're quite simple in terms of setting out the expectations placed on organisations. Organisations appreciate that. They know what needs to be done in order to deliver against standards. So, I would say that there is a direct link between the standards and the change that we have seen.

[193] Ac rydym ni'n gweld hynny o ran newid diwylliant hefyd, o ran y sefydliadau. Yr adborth oddi wrth brif weithredwyr yn gyffredinol yw, 'Rwy'n gwybod lle rwy'n mynd. Rwy'n gwybod beth yw'r disgwyliadau. Rwy'n gwybod pwy i droi ato, sef chi, pan mae yna broblemau', a'u bod nhw'n gweld hynny'n fuddiol.

And we see that in terms of culture change too, within organisations. The feedback from chief executives generally speaking is, 'I know the direction of travel. I know what's expected. I know who to turn to, namely you, when problems do arise', and they see that as being beneficial.

[194] Roeddwn i jest yn edrych ar rywbeth o'r Fflint *Leader* ddoe, lle mae'r cyngor yn Fflint wedi gwneud datganiad clir iawn ynglŷn â'r ffaith eu bod nhw nawr yn mynd i edrych am weithwyr dwyieithog oherwydd eu bod nhw'n gweld hynny o fudd. Mae hynny wedi mynd drwy'r cabinet, rwy'n deall, yn ystod yr wythnos yma. So, mae yna newid diwylliannol yn digwydd oherwydd y safonau hefyd.

I was just looking at something from the Flint *Leader* yesterday, where the council in Flint have made a very clear statement on the fact that they now will be seeking bilingual workers because they see the benefit of that. I think that's gone through the cabinet, as I understand it, during this week. So, there is a cultural change happening because of standards too.

[195] **Mr Dafydd:** I ategu beth mae Meri yn ei glywed gan brif weithredwyr, mae'r hyn rydym ni'n ei glywed yn y gweithdai rydym ni'n eu cynnal efo arbenigwyr yn dweud wrthym ni hefyd fod y safonau yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Maen nhw'n dweud bod y Gymraeg bellach yn cael ei hintegreiddio i weithdrefnau a phrosesau o fewn y sefydliad, lle yr oedd gynt efallai yn cael ei gweld fel rhywbeth ar wahân. Mae bellach yn rhan o reoli prosiect, adrodd ar gynnydd ac asesu effaith, ac yn y blaen.

Mr Dafydd: To add to what Meri is hearing from chief executives, what we hear in the workshops with experts tells us also that the standards are making a difference. They say that the Welsh language now is being integrated into their procedures and processes within the organisation, where perhaps in the past it was seen as something that was separate. It is now part of project management, progress reports and impact assessment, and so on.

[196] Mae'r cyfrifoldeb yn cael ei wasgaru o fewn y corff fwy. Lle'r oedd gyda chi o'r blaen swyddog

The responsibility is distributed more within an organisation. Whereas before you had a Welsh language

iaith yn gweithio ar ei ben ei hun ac yn trio gwrthio newidiadau, mae rheolwyr unigol bellach yn cymryd cyfrifoldeb yn eu meysydd eu hunain am weithredu yn y Gymraeg, ac mae'r agweddau'n gadarnhaol hefyd.

officer working by themselves and trying to push changes, now individual managers are taking responsibility in their areas for implementing aspects through the medium of Welsh, and the attitudes are also positive.

[197] Hynny ydy, mae'r safonau yn fanwl, mae'r gofynion yn eithaf caeth, ac mae yna hefyd bwerau gorfodi, ond mae'r agweddau ymhlith staff sefydliadau yn llawer mwy cadarnhaol nag y buasech chi'n ei ddisgwyl oherwydd hynny. Mae'r ffaith bod yna sicrwydd ynghylch y dyletswyddau yn rhan o hynny.

That is, the standards are detailed, the requirements are quite stringent, and there are also enforcement powers, but the attitudes of staff members of organisations are much more positive than you would expect as a result of that. The fact that there are assurances about the responsibilities is part of that.

[198] Mae'r safonau'n cael eu gweld hefyd fel cerbyd i wella pethau. Rwyf wedi ffeindio hynny'n gadarnhaol iawn. Mae yna lot o waith da wedi digwydd hefyd o ran cyfathrebu mewnol sefydliadau, lle maen nhw'n disgrifio panig ar y dechrau, ofn efallai, ond wrth gynnal sgysiau efo swyddogion maen nhw'n gweld eu hunain yn gallu cael y neges yma drwyddo—cerbyd i wella ydy hwn, i wella gwasanaethau cwsmeriaid. Mae'r agweddau'n gadarnhaol yn ôl y negeseuon rydym ni'n eu cael.

The standards are also being seen as a vehicle to drive improvement. I have found that very positive. A lot of good work has been done in terms of internal communications of organisations, where they describe panic initially, fear perhaps, but in conducting conversations with officers they see that they can get this message through—this is a vehicle for improvement, to improve customer service. The attitudes are positive, according to the messages we are receiving.

[199] **Hannah Blythyn:** Thanks. As I understand, it's currently only a requirement on 10 public organisations to provide an entire response in Welsh. Is that right? Why is that? What's the reasoning? And, how is that going to develop?

[200] **Ms Huws:** Fel roeddwn i'n adrodd cynt, mae'r set gyntaf o safonau yn berthnasol i awdurdodau

Ms Huws: As I said earlier, the first set of standards is relevant to local authorities in Wales, the Welsh

lleol Cymru, Llywodraeth Cymru a'r parciau cenedlaethol. Nhw sydd yn gweithredu o dan y safonau—y set gyntaf, y set gyflawn yna.

Government and the national parks. They are operating under the first set of standards—that first full set of standards.

[201] Erbyn hyn, mae 78 o sefydliadau—ac mae'r prifysgolion a cholegau addysg bellach i ddod. Erbyn hyn, mae sefydliadau mawr cyhoeddus Cymru yn yr ail set o reoliadau—yr amgueddfeydd, y llyfrgell genedlaethol, Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru, ac yn y blaen.

There are now 78 organisations—and the universities and further education colleges are to come. By now, the major public bodies in Wales are included in the second set of regulations—the museums, the national library, Natural Resources Wales, and so on.

[202] Ac wedyn yn y setiau a ddaeth wedyn, yn y setiau a ddaeth wedyn, y tribiwnlysoedd i gyd yng Nghymru, yr heddluoedd a'r gwasanaethau achub, ac nawr y sefydliadau addysg ôl-16. So, erbyn hyn, erbyn heddiw, 78 yn gweithredu'n llawn o dan y safonau, 103 erbyn diwedd mis Ebrill.

And then the third set, the tribunals in Wales, the police forces and the emergency services, and now the post-16 education sector. So, by today there are 78 working fully under standards, and 103 by the end of April.

[203] **Bethan Jenkins:** A ydyn ni'n sôn am y ffonau? Deg o sefydliadau sy'n ofynnol iddynt ddarparu ymateb yn gyfan gwbl yn y Gymraeg, nid—

Bethan Jenkins: Are we talking about telephones? There are 10 organisations that must provide a response entirely in Welsh.

[204] **Mr Dafydd:** Yn ystod y broses gosod safonau, mae yna *menu*—os leiciwch chi—o wahanol safonau. Mae gofynion mwy caeth na'i gilydd o ran y ffôn a rydym ni'n mynd drwy'r broses gosod safonau er mwyn penderfynu beth sy'n rhesymol ac yn gymesur i osod ar wahanol sefydliadau sydd mewn gwahanol sefyllfaoedd. Efo ffonau, mae yna 10 sefydliad—rydych chi'n gywir i nodi—sy'n gorfod darparu yr ymateb cyflawn yn Gymraeg o'r dechrau i'r

Mr Dafydd: During the standards process, there is a menu of options. Some are more stringent than others in terms of telephone services and we go through the standard-setting process to decide what's proportionate and reasonable to expect of various organisations in different situations. With telephones, you're right that there are 10 that have to provide that full service through the medium of Welsh from beginning to end, and there are

diwedd, ond mae yna sefydliadau eraill lle rydym ni wedi dod i'r farn mai'r hyn sy'n rhesymol ac yn gymesur ydy bod y sawl sy'n derbyn yr alwad yn deall yr ymholiad ac yn ei drosglwyddo fo wedyn i rywun all gynnig ateb mwy cyflawn, mwy arbenigol. Felly, mae'n gywir i nodi bod yna ddyletswyddau gwahanol.

others where we've come to the opinion that what's reasonable and proportionate is that the person taking the call should understand the inquiry and then transfer that inquiry to someone who can provide a fuller, more expert response in Welsh. So, it's correct to say there are different duties on different organisations.

[205] **Bethan Jenkins:** Suzy Davies.

Bethan Jenkins: Suzy Davies.

[206] **Suzy Davies:** Diolch yn fawr. Jest cwpwl o gwestiynau ar dderbynfeydd: jest i ddechrau gyda'r arwyddion, mae'n debyg i fi, erbyn hyn, nid oes esgus o gwbl i beidio cael pob arwydd yn ddwyieithog. Rydw i'n gweld y gwelliant, wrth gwrs, ond a ydych chi'n gwybod pam nad ydym ni ar 100 y cant eto? A ydym ni'n sôn am arwyddion dros dro neu bobl yn dod i mewn yn sticio taflenni ar y wal? A oes gennym ni unrhyw resymau?

Suzy Davies: Thank you very much. I've got just a couple of questions on reception areas. If we start with signage, it appears to me that there's no excuse at all not to have every sign bilingually. I'm seeing the improvement, of course, but do you know why we're not on 100 per cent now? Are we talking about temporary signs or people coming in and putting pamphlets on the wall? Do we have any reasons?

[207] **Ms Price:** Rydw i'n meddwl ei bod hi'n anodd dadansoddi'r rhesymau manwl am bob un llithriad o'r natur yna. Nid ydw i'n meddwl ei fod o'n ddim byd i wneud efo'r gyfundrefn fel y cyfryw. Fe all o wneud efo perfformiad gwael sefydliad; fe all o fod bod rheoleiddiwr yn caniatáu i bobl beidio â gwneud beth ddylen nhw wneud. Ond mae'n gynnar arnom ni—. Dyma'r tro cyntaf i ni wneud cip arolwg i weld beth ydy'r problemau. Rydw i'n meddwl mai'r pwynt fyddwn i'n ei wneud efo mân bethau fel yna

Ms Price: It's difficult to analyse the reasons for every slip of that nature. I don't think it's anything to do with the regime as such. It can relate to the poor performance of an institution; it can be that a regulator is allowing people not to do what they should be doing. But it's at an early stage, and this is the first time that we've had a snap survey just to identify the problems. I think the point I would make with those minor things is that they are very numerous, and I do believe that that is because we are transferring from a

ydy eu bod nhw'n niferus iawn, ac rydw i'n grediniol bod hynny oherwydd ein bod ni'n trosglwyddo o drefn cynlluniau iaith lle nid oedd yna gamau pellach, lle roedd sefydliadau, efallai, wedi mynd i arfer â phheidio gwneud pethau roedden nhw wedi ymrwymo iddyn nhw. Mae'r drefn yma'n gofyn am newid diwylliant, ac mae yna newid, rydw i'n meddwl, rhwng y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf a'r un cynt—bod yna ganrannau'n dangos newid clir.

language scheme system where there was no enforcement action, where organisations, possibly, had become used not to doing things they were committed to. This standards system does call for a culture change and there has been a change, I think, from the last financial year and the previous financial year. There are percentages that demonstrate clear change.

[208] Felly, rydym ni'n ceisio cynnal y newid yna a sicrhau bod arferion fel y rhai rydych chi'n eu nodi yn lleihau dros amser. Ond mae o'n golygu wedyn ein bod ni'n gorfod edrych ar y broblem yn ei chyfanrwydd—nid mân bethau. Mae'r adroddiad yma, mewn ffordd, yn rhoi darlun i sefydliadau o beth ydy'r sefyllfa yn hytrach na'n bod ni'n ymchwilio i lot o bethau unigol, a rydym ni'n gobeithio y byddan nhw'n ymateb. Mae gennym ni gynlluniau amrywiol er mwyn gweithio efo nhw. Rydym ni'n mynd i weld nifer uchel o sefydliadau'n unigol, felly rydych chi'n cael adroddiad yn rhoi'r darlun cyffredinol. Rydym ni'n gwybod hefyd beth ydy perfformiad corff unigol, felly byddwn ni'n mynd i siarad efo nhw a dangos iddyn nhw beth rydym ni wedi'i ganfod yn eu sefyllfa nhw, a byddan nhw'n gallu cywiro, datblygu a newid ar sail sgwrs a chyfarfod adborth. Rydym ni wedi sôn am y gweithdai: pan fyddwn ni'n mynd i'r afael efo problemau mwy, a'r cynnig

So, we are trying to maintain that momentum and ensure that the practices such as those you note do reduce over a period of time. But it does mean that we have to look at the problem in its entirety, not look at the minutiae. This report, in a way, does give organisations a picture of what the situation is, rather than us carrying out investigations into numerous individual issues, and we hope that they will respond. We do have various programmes where we will work with them. We do go and see a high number of organisations on an individual basis, so this report gives you the bigger picture. We also know what the performance of individual organisations is, and therefore we will go to speak to them and we will tell them what our findings are, and then they can put right any deficiencies and develop and change on the basis of that feedback. We've talked about the workshops: when we tackle greater problems, and this year it's the active

rhagweithiol a hybu ydy o eleni, rydym ni'n mynd i fod yn trio chwilio am ffyrdd ymlaen fel grŵp efo sefydliadau. Rydym ni—

offer and promotion, then we will be seeking ways forward as a group working with organisations. We are—

[209] **Suzy Davies:** A allaf i jest ddweud, rydw i'n derbyn beth rydych chi'n ei ddweud, ond gyda rhywbeth fel arwyddion, does dim rheswm *really* i roi mwy o amser iddyn nhw neu dderbyn esgus oddi wrthyn nhw?

Suzy Davies: Can I just say, I accept what you're saying, but with something such as signage, there is no reason, really, to give them more time or to accept an excuse from them?

[210] **Ms Price:** Na, na. Dim o gwbl: mae'r ddyletswydd yna, mae'r diwrnod gosod yn ei le, ond rydw i'n meddwl, fel rheoleiddiwr, mae gennym ni mewn ffordd ddewis, onid oes? Byddem ni'n gallu mynd ar ôl pob methiant yn unigol neu mi allwn ni wneud gwaith fel hwn a chyhoeddi adroddiad a gofyn i sefydliadau ymateb a chywiro, ac rydw i'n meddwl bod hynny'n ffordd fwy rhesymol o ddelio efo rhywbeth. Os ydym ni'n gweld bod yna angen i bawb wella efo'i gilydd a'i fod o mor hawdd i wneud beth bynnag, byddem ni'n dymuno eu gweld nhw'n ymateb i'r adroddiad drwy gyfarfod a sylweddoli. Mae ganddyn nhw le, rydw i'n meddwl, i wneud mwy o hunan-reoleiddio. Ni allwch chi fod yn dibynnu ar reoleiddiwr i wneud pob peth, ond pan aethom ni allan a chyfweld mewn sefydliadau, rydw i'n meddwl bod 77 y cant ohonyn nhw wedi methu rhoi enghreifftiau i ni o hybu, lle mi oedd yna rai yn gallu, ond roedden nhw'n meddwl eu bod nhw'n gwneud, pan oeddem ni'n mesur. Roedden nhw'n meddwl bod y

Ms Price: No, not at all. The duty is there, the implementation date is in place, but as a regulator, we have an option, don't we? We have a choice: we could pursue every individual failing or we can do work such as this and publish a report, and ask organisations to respond and put right any problems, and I think that that's a more reasonable approach in dealing with an issue. If we do see that there is a need for everyone to improve and that it's such an easy thing to do in any case, then we would want to see them responding to the report in having a meeting with us so that we can explain. I think there is room for more self-regulation. You can't rely on a regulator to do everything on your behalf, but when we went out and interviewed people within organisations, I think that 77 per cent had failed to provide us with examples of promotion, where some were able to do that, but they thought they were doing it, when we were monitoring. They thought that the badges were in place and that the

bathodynau yna, bod y cynnig yn digwydd. Felly, mae'n rhaid iddyn nhw, rydw i'n meddwl, fod yn fwy systematig a deall yn well, efallai.

active offer was there. So, I think they have to be more systematic and they have to understand better, perhaps.

[211] **Suzy Davies:** Ond *easy hits* yw'r rheini. A ydy rhai ohonyn nhw wedi dweud, 'Wel, *actually*, rŷm ni'n derbyn bod yna broblem, ac rŷm ni'n mynd i'w wneud e'r flwyddyn nesaf, gyda'r gyllideb nesaf', er enghraifft?

Suzy Davies: But these are easy hits. Have some of them said, 'Well, actually, we accept there's a problem, and we're going to do it next year, with next year's budget', for example?

[212] **Ms Price:** Ydyn, yn sicr.

Ms Price: Most certainly, yes.

[213] **Ms Huws:** Rydw i'n credu, gyda chyhoeddi'r adroddiad yma—mae'r galw sydd wedi dod i mewn i'r swyddfa am *lanyards* iaith gwaith wedi saethu trwy'r to oddi ar gyhoeddi hwn, ac rydw i'n credu bod teclynnau fel hyn yn bwysig. Mae hwn wedi cyrraedd desg prif weithredwr, ac mae rhywun wedi gofyn, 'A ydym ni'n gwneud hyn?' 'Na, nid ydym ni'n ei wneud e'n gyffredinol.' 'Mae'n rhaid inni ei wneud e nawr.' So, felly rydw i'n credu bod hwn yn rhan o'r pecyn o newid arfer. Fel y dywedodd Gwenith, rydw i'n credu, pan fo'n broblem fwy cyffredinol, cael y neges mas a'u cael nhw i ymateb sydd yn bwysig, rydw i'n credu.

Ms Huws: I think, with the publication of this report—the demand in the office for the *iaith gwaith* lanyards has gone through the roof since we published this assurance report, and I think tools such as this are important. This has landed on the desk of a chief executive, and someone's asked, 'Are we doing this?' 'Well, generally speaking, no.' 'We have to do it now.' So, I do think this is part of the package of behavioural change. As Gwenith said, I think, when it's a more general problem, it's a matter of getting the message out there and getting them to respond; I think that's the important point here.

[214] **Suzy Davies:** Ai dyna sut ydych chi'n delio â phobl y tu ôl i'r cownters, er enghraifft, hefyd? A ydych chi'n chwilio am ddiffyg yn y rheini sy'n siarad Cymraeg o safbwynt diwylliannol, yn lle dweud wrth unrhyw gyngor, er enghraifft, 'Come on, rŷch chi wedi cael cwpwl o

Suzy Davies: And is that how you deal with people behind counters, for example, as well? Are you looking at those who don't speak Welsh in terms of a cultural change, rather than telling any council, for example, 'Come on, you've had a couple of years now. There aren't enough

flynyddoedd nawr. Nid oes digon o bobl y tu ôl i'r cownter sy'n siarad Cymraeg. Beth yw'r rheswm?', a sut allech chi helpu?

people behind the counter that speak Welsh. What is the reason?', and how can you help?

[215] **Ms Price:** Mae'n gyfuniad, rydw i'n meddwl. Mae yna, efallai, achosion lle mae yna bethau wedi mynd o'u lle, ac mae'n bosib bod yna ymchwiliad wedi digwydd oherwydd efallai nad yw sefydliad wedi mynd i'r afael yn strategol efo'i dderbynfeydd i gyd. Drwy broses o osod, mi oedd yna gyfnod o herio a thrafod a meddwl beth sy'n rhesymol. Mae yna dair math o safon ar gyfer derbynfeydd. Felly, rydym ni wedi cymryd cam yn ôl a meddwl beth sy'n rhesymol—prif dderbynfeydd, derbynfeydd llai ac yn y blaen. Felly, mae o wedi cymryd amser i ni ddod at bwynt o feddwl beth i wneud efo pawb, ond mae mân bethau o beidio â dangos bod rhywun yn gallu defnyddio'r Gymraeg pan fo'r staff yn medru yn rhywbeth mor hawdd i'w ddatrys. Dylasai hynny ddigwydd drwy drafodaeth, rydw i'n credu.

Ms Price: It's a combination of factors, I think. I think there are cases perhaps where things have gone wrong and there may have been an investigation because perhaps an organisation hasn't tackled its reception areas on a strategic level. Through imposing standards, there was a period of challenge and considering what was reasonable. There are three kinds of standards for reception areas. So, we have taken a step back and looked at what is reasonable—main reception areas, smaller reception areas and so on and so forth. So, it has taken us time to get to a point where we consider what to do in all circumstances, but issues of not displaying that an individual is able to provide a Welsh-language service when that service is available are so easily resolved. That should happen through discussion, I think.

[216] **Mr Dafydd:** Mae hynny'n gywir, ac rydw i'n meddwl eich bod chi'n iawn i sôn am yr *easy hits* yma, oherwydd mae'r dystiolaeth ynghylch y gwelliannau o ran gwasanaethau rheng flaen—y ffôn a'r dderbynfa, ac yn y blaen—yn dangos bod sefydliadau wedi bod yn cynllunio eu gweithlu mewn ffordd sydd yn galluogi i'r gwasanaethau yna, y gwasanaethau pwysig yna, fod ar

Mr Dafydd: That's right, and I think you're right to talk about these easy hits, because the evidence in terms of the improvements in front-line services—phones and receptions, for example—shows that organisations have been planning their workforce in a way that enables those services, those vital services, to be available in Welsh. It's much more complex to improve a service where you have

gael yn Gymraeg. Mae cymaint yn fwy cymhleth gwella gwasanaeth lle mae gennych chi staffio ac yn y blaen na phethau fel sortio arwydd a dangos bathodynau.

staffing and so forth than things such as sorting out a sign and wearing badges.

[217] Mae yna ddiffygion o ran adrodd ar ofynion newydd penodol yn yr adroddiad blyneddol mae sefydliadau'n gorfod ei gyhoeddi. Hynny ydy, mae rheini'n bethau y gallwch chi eu sortio heb fod angen buddsoddiad adnodd mawr. Fel yr oedd Gwenith yn ei ddweud, yr ateb ydy hunanreoleiddio: bod angen i sefydliadau fynd ati yn systematig i edrych drwy ofynion y safonau. Mae sefydliadau'n dweud wrthym ni yn y gweithdai yma, lle maen nhw wedi trosglwyddo gofynion y safonau i mewn i raglenni gwaith, i mewn i restr o dasgau ar gyfer rheolwyr penodol o fewn y sefydliadau, fod hynny wedi cyflymu gwelliant. Felly, ie, mae yna *easy hits* i'w gwneud, ac mae angen i sefydliadau wneud mwy o hunanreoleiddio.

There are deficiencies in terms of reporting back on new specific requirements in the annual reports that organisations have to publish. That is, those are things that you can sort without having to invest massively in resources. As Gwenith said, the answer is self-regulation. Organisations need to look systematically at the requirements in the standards. Organisations tell us in these workshops that, where they have transferred the standards requirements into work programmes and into a series of tasks for specific managers within organisations, that that has speeded up the process of improvement. So, there are easy hits and organisations need to do more self-regulation.

[218] **Suzy Davies:** Ie. Rwy'n ei dderbyn e'n fwy gyda staff, achos nid ydych chi'n gallu jest cael gwared ar staff achos nad ydyn nhw'n siarad Cymraeg, er enghraifft, ond y tro nesaf y bydd yr adroddiad nesaf yn dod mas, a ydym ni'n mynd i weld cynnydd?

Suzy Davies: I accept that with staff, because you can't just get rid of staff because they don't speak Welsh, but, next time, when the next report is published, are we going to see progress?

[219] **Ms Huws:** Buaswn i'n disgwyl. Buaswn i'n disgwyl, yn sicr.

Ms Huws: I would expect so, yes. I would certainly expect so.

[220] **Suzy Davies:** Diolch.

[221] **Bethan Jenkins:** Lee Waters.

[222] **Lee Waters:** One area where there is some difficulty making progress, it seems, is around digital. I was just wondering if you could set out what the expectations under the standards are for delivering services through the digital means for those organisations covered.

[223] **Ms Huws:** Os gallaf i jest ddechrau, rydw i'n credu bod y safonau o gwmpas disgwyliadau digidol yn newydd, maen nhw'n heriol, ac rŷm ni'n cydnabod hynny, oherwydd mae hon yn daith rŷm ni i gyd yn mynd arni hi, pe bai yn awdurdodau lleol neu'n fusnesau. O ganlyniad i hynny—ac rydw i yn mynd i droi at y rheini nawr—rŷm ni wedi cydnabod hynny, ac rŷm ni, fel y buasai rheoleiddiwr da yn gwneud, yn dweud, 'Reit, rŷm ni'n adnabod problem. Gad i ni gydgerdded a thrial ffeindio datrysiadau.'

Ms Huws: If I could just start, I do think that the standards around digital expectations are new and challenging, and we recognise that, because this is a journey that we are all undertaking, be it local authorities or businesses. As a result of that—and I will turn to these now—we recognise this, and, as any good regulator would do, we are saying, 'We've identified a problem. Let's take this journey together and find resolutions together.'

11:15

[224] **Ms Price:** Wel, mae yna ddau beth. Mae gennym ni bethau rydym ni wedi'i ddysgu am gyfryngau cymdeithasol. Mae gennym ni hefyd ddarn gwaith rydym ni'n ei wneud efo cofnodi dewis iaith, ac, os gwnaf i hwnnw yn gyntaf, efallai y gwneith Guto sôn wedyn am y cyfryngau cymdeithasol.

[225] **Ms Price:** Well, there are two issues. There's what we've learnt about social media. We've also got a piece of work that we're looking at in registering language of choice. I'll do that first and then Guto will come in on social media.

[226] Un o'r pethau rydym ni'n ei weld sydd wedi bod yn rhwystr neu'n broblem i sefydliadau oedd yr angen i gofnodi dewis iaith. Mae yna safon benodol lle mae angen cynnig a

One of the issues that we've seen that has been a barrier or a problem for organisations was the requirement to register the language of choice. There is a specific standard

chanfod beth ydy'r dewis, cofnodi a rhannu ar draws y sefydliad y dewis yna, ac o'r pwynt hwnnw ymlaen parhau yn yr iaith o'u dewis. Ond nid pawb oedd efo systemau *customer relationship management* neu roedd problemau rhannu o adran i adran ac yn y blaen. Rydym ni wedi dewis rhoi amser ac adnoddau i mewn i edrych ar y broblem yma.

where there is a need to offer and find out what the choice is and register and share that across the organisation, and, from that point forward, continue in that language of choice. But not everybody had customer relationship management systems, or there were problems of sharing between departments. We've chosen to give time and resource to looking at this.

[227] Rydym ni'n gweithio efo Socitm efo rhai sefydliadau. Mae rhai wedi dod i ddatrysiadau lleol trwy fuddsoddi a thynnu adrannau i mewn, ond yn fwy cyffredinol rydw i'n meddwl ein bod ni wedi gweld newid agwedd o'i weld o fel problem i'w weld o fel cyfle, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd lle mae yna niferoedd llai. Un o'r pethau sydd wedi cael ei awgrymu gan rai o'r awdurdodau lleol ydy y bydden nhw'n dymuno, o bosib, dros amser, ein gweld ni'n cael un cyfrif dinesydd. Yn yr Alban, mae gennych chi myaccount, lle mae'r Aeleg i mewn yn y dechnoleg o'r cychwyn, a'ch bod chi'n gallu mynd at wasanaeth efo'r un cyfrif yma—dim ots pa sefydliad, ac maen nhw'n ychwanegu sefydliadau dros amser—ac mae hwnnw mewn bodolaeth ers 2014. Felly, rydw i'n meddwl bod yn rhaid i ni weithio efo nhw i weld a oes modd cael datrysiadau dros amser, ac maen nhw'n werth eu gwneud, achos mae'r budd o ran tynnu costau i lawr dros amser, eu bod nhw'n gallu teilwra gwasanaethau i'r rhai sydd eu

We're working with Socitm with some organisations. Some have found local answers by investing and bringing departments in, but on a more general level we've seen a change of attitude, from seeing it as a problem to seeing it as an opportunity, in particular in areas where there are fewer numbers, and I think one of the things that's been suggested by local authorities is that they would wish, possibly, over time, to see us having one citizen's account. In Scotland, you have myaccount, where Gaelic is in the technology from the beginning, and you can go to a service with this one account—it doesn't matter what organisation, and they are adding organisations over time—and that has existed since 2014. So, I think we have to work with them to see if there's a way of finding a resolution to this over time, and they're worth doing, because the benefit in terms of bringing costs down over time, and that they can tailor these services to people who need them, is worth the time in working on this kind of aspect, and

hangen, yn werth yr amser yn I'm very keen to continue to see what
gweithio ar y math yma o beth. Rydw we can do.
i'n awyddus iawn i barhau i weld beth
y gallwn ni ei wneud.

[228] **Lee Waters:** In terms of online provision, do you make a distinction between static content—so, you may have a website where it just doesn't change so providing it bilingually should be fairly straightforward—and then more dynamic content that may be updated regularly, particularly in social media, where it may be more resource intensive to provide and keep that up to date?

[229] **Ms Price:** A wyt ti eisiau mynd **Ms Price:** Do you want to take that
ar ôl hynny, Guto? point, Guto?

[230] **Mr Dafydd:** Nid ydy'r safonau **Mr Dafydd:** The standards don't draw
yn tynnu gwahaniaeth yn y fanna. Y a distinction there. The requirement
gofyniad efo gwefannau ac efo'r with websites and social media is
cyfryngau cymdeithasol ydy peidio â that we shouldn't treat the Welsh
thrin y Gymraeg yn llai ffafriol na'r language less favourably than the
Saesneg. Rydw i wedi sôn eisoes am English language. I've already
wefannau ac, fel roeddech chi'n ei mentioned websites and, as you
awgrymu, mae cynnwys statig yn suggested, static content tends to be
tueddu i fod yn well na chynnwys better than content that's regularly
sy'n cael ei ddiweddarau yn aml. updated.

[231] O ran cyfryngau cymdeithasol, In terms of social media, then, a
wedyn, gofyniad nad oedd yn rhan o requirement that wasn't part of
gynlluniau iaith at ei gilydd, fe language schemes generally
wnaethom ni adolygu hwn reit ar speaking, we looked at this at the
ddechrau'r cyfnod adrodd, felly y very beginning of the reporting
buaswn i'n gobeithio gweld gwelliant period, so I would hope to see
erbyn hyn, ond roedd yr ystadegau improvement by this point, but the
yn y fanna yn eithaf siomedig: 23 y stats there were quite disappointing:
cant o gyfrifon Twitter a oedd yn 23 per cent of Twitter accounts
darparu gwasanaeth cyfartal yn y provided an equal service in both
ddwy iaith. Eleni, rydym ni'n edrych languages. This year, we are looking
ar fath arall o wasanaeth digidol, at another digital service, self-service
peiriannau hunanwasanaeth. Mae machines. That's an area where we
hwnnw'n faes lle rydym ni'n awyddus are eager to see improvement,
i weld gwelliant, oherwydd rydym because we are aware of this shift in

ni'n ymwybodol o'r *shift* yma o ran sut mae sefydliadau yn darparu gwasanaeth. Maen nhw eisiau ei wneud o efo cyn lleied o adnoddau a phosib, yn amlwg. Felly, fe fyddwn ni'n edrych ymlaen at weld beth fydd canlyniadau'r arolwg hwnnw.

terms of how organisations provide services. They want to do it in a resource efficient manner, and obviously we will be looking forward to seeing the results of those surveys.

[232] Ond mae yna lefydd lle mae sefydliadau wedi defnyddio technoleg gwybodaeth yn greadigol er mwyn gwella gwasanaeth. Yn edrych ar y ffôn, er enghraifft, roeddem ni'n gweld cynnydd mawr iawn rhwng 2015–16 ac 2016–17 o ran galwadau ffôn yn cael eu hateb yn awtomatig a bod y bobl sy'n dymuno cael y gwasanaeth Cymraeg yn cael y cynnig yna yn rhagweithiol, bod y cyfarchiad yn Gymraeg oherwydd bod hwnnw'n cael ei wneud drwy wasanaeth awtomatig. Mae honno'n ffordd fwy effeithlon i sefydliadau weithio ac mae'n eu helpu nhw i gydymffurfio.

But there are areas where organisations have used IT in a creative way in order to improve services. If you look at the telephone, for example, we saw a huge increase between 2015–16 and 2016–17 in terms of phone calls answered automatically and that people wanting a Welsh language service would be given that proactive offer, that that greeting was available in Welsh because it was an automated service. That's a more effective way for organisations to work and it helps them comply with standards.

[233] **Lee Waters:** Can I just take you back to your point on social media in particular? Is it your expectation that organisations covered by the standards shouldn't be tweeting in English only?

[234] **Ms Huws:** A gaf i ateb hwnnw? Dyna mae'r safon yn ei ddweud: na ddylid trin y Gymraeg yn llai ffafriol na'r Saesneg. Ond un maes lle mae hwn wedi codi trafodaethau—a thrafodaethau sy'n parhau—yw'r heddluoedd, wrth gwrs, sydd yn defnyddio trydar yn aml i gysylltu'n gymunedol neu i gysylltu mewn argyfwng. Wel, mae sefyllfa argyfwng un cael ei heithrio o'r safonau. Mae hynny'n glir o ran y safonau. Ond

Ms Huws: If I could respond to that, that's what the standard says: the Welsh language should be treated no less favourably than the English language, but one area where this has arisen—and these are ongoing discussions—is the police forces, of course, who use Twitter very often to engage the community or in times of crisis. But that is exempt from the standards, in terms of urgent matters. That is clear in terms of the

mae yna drafodaethau diddorol iawn yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd ynglŷn â sut mae'r heddluoedd, sydd yn awyddus i drydar yn ddwyieithog, yn datblygu'r gallu i wneud hynny. Un peth maen nhw'n ei wneud fel heddluoedd yw edrych ar beth yw math y negeseuon sydd yn mynd allan. Wel, un math o negeseuon sy'n tueddu i fynd allan yn rheolaidd yw, 'Mae yna gar wedi'i barcio mewn lle anghywir'. So, i gael cyfieithiadau safonol ar gyfer sefyllfa fel yna, ac mae'r heddluoedd—mae Dyfed-Powys yn arbennig yn edrych ar greu pecyn o drydariadau y gallai heddw eu defnyddio wrth iddo fo neu wrth iddi hi fod yn cerdded o gwmpas. Rŷm ni'n croesawu hynny ac yn gweithio gyda nhw i ddatblygu'r math yna o sefyllfa. Mae modd wedyn iddyn nhw rannu hwnnw gyda'r gwasanaethau achub eraill. So, maen nhw'n gweithio ar y cyd i ffeindio ffyrdd i oresgyn beth sydd yn broblem yn y lle cyntaf, ond i ddatblygu'r dechnoleg a datblygu galluoedd.

standards. But there are interesting discussions in terms of how the police, who are eager to tweet bilingually, develop the capacity to do that. One thing that they do as police forces is to look at the kinds of messages conveyed. Well, it's the same kind of message that they send out regularly—there's a car that's been parked in the wrong place, for example. So, you could have standard translations for such circumstances, and the police forces—Dyfed-Powys in particular are looking at creating a package of tweets that a police officer could use during their working day. We welcome that, and we are working with them in order to develop those kinds of templates, and then they can share that with the other emergency services. So, they are working jointly to find ways of overcoming what is initially a problem, but to develop technologies and abilities in those areas.

[235] **Lee Waters:** I'm just thinking in practical terms, I'm not sure: is Arriva trains, for example, covered by the standards?

[236] **Ms Huws:** No.

[237] **Lee Waters:** Well, just to take them as an example, they've begun to use social media in quite a good way—bad start, caught up—and so they will communicate with passengers who've got some kind of complaint well, but they'll do it in English. Now, just to take that as an example of a public service provision, it would seem to me that, if we're going to insist that all communications are done bilingually at all times, that may well constrain them from using this new form of communicating in a dynamic and lively

way.

[238] **Sian Gwenllian:** Jest pwynt o wybodaeth, maen nhw'n fy ateb i yn y Gymraeg. Mae Arriva—pan fyddaf i'n trydar cwyn, rydw i'n cael ateb I get a response in Welsh, which is—. Cymraeg, sydd yn—.

[239] **Lee Waters:** And that's excellent, and that's appropriate if you're responding in Welsh, but if you're responding in English—. If we were to require them to respond bilingually, as an example, if you were to apply that to other organisations—. I'm just trying to get a sense of how realistically we're thinking about how a Twitter policy might work, for example, in organisations that are covered by the standards.

[240] **Ms Price:** Wel, mae'r safonau wedi'u gosod gan y Llywodraeth, ac maen nhw'n cael eu cymeradwyo gan y Cynulliad erbyn y pwynt maen nhw'n cyrraedd y comisiynydd i ni eu gosod nhw. Nid ydw i'n meddwl bod gennym ni'r awdurdod mewn ffordd i newid y safon. Rydym ni'n gallu amrywio neu newid y diwrnod gosod, ond nid oes gennym ni fel swyddogion yr awdurdod i newid beth ydy'r gofyniad. Mae'n anodd i ni drin a thrafod efo chi, mewn ffordd. Mae'r cod ymarfer, efallai, yn rhywle lle gallem ni ddelio maes o law â phethau. Rydym ni yn gwneud—efo safonau newydd yn enwedig, rydym ni wedi rhoi cyngor nawr ac yn y man lle mae pobl wedi cael trafferthion dehongli, ac yn rhoi cyngor er mwyn egluro yn fwy cyffredinol beth mae'r safon yn gofyn amdano.

Ms Price: Well, the standards have been set by the Government, and they're approved by the Assembly by the point that they get to the commissioner to implement them. I don't think we have the authority, in a way, to change the standards. We can vary or we can change the date of imposition, but we don't have the authority to change what the requirement is. So, it's difficult for us to discuss with you, in a way. The code of practice, perhaps, is somewhere where we could deal with issues. With new standards in particular we have provided advice now and again where people have had difficulty interpreting them, and we have provided advice in general explaining what the standard requires.

[241] **Ms Huws:** Rydw i'n credu, fel rŷm ni wedi bod yn pwysleisio, rheoleiddio er mwyn gwella a

Ms Huws: I think, as we've emphasised, regulating for improvement and progress is what's

chynnydd sydd eu hangen. A dyna le mae'r sefydliadau, rydw i'n credu, wedi gweld ac wedi profi newid diwylliant. Achos rydw i wedi sôn am yr heddlu, gwnaf sôn amdany'n nhw eto: maen nhw'n ei weld e fel cyfle i gyrraedd mwy o gynulleidfa mewn ffordd effeithiol, trwy drydar yn y ddwy iaith. Mae Heddlu Gwent, er enghraifft, yn awyddus iawn, iawn i ddatblygu'r gallu yma ac yn gweld y safonau fel man cychwyn i wella'r gwasanaeth.

what's required. And I think that's where the organisations have seen and experienced culture change. I've mentioned the police forces, and I'll do so again: they see it as an opportunity to reach a larger audience in an effective way through tweeting in both languages. Gwent Police, for example, are very eager to develop this capacity. They see the standards as a starting point in order to improve services.

[242] So, felly, rydw i'n credu bod technoleg gwybodaeth yn heriol, ond mae'n gallu cynnig atebion hefyd wrth ein bod ni'n symud ymlaen. Ac mae hwn yn faes sy'n codi mewn gwledydd eraill lle mae yna fwy nag un iaith. Mae'n digwydd ar draws y byd. Mae'r un trafodaethau yn digwydd yn Canada ynglŷn â thrydar mewn dwy iaith, ac felly rydw i'n credu y gallem ni ddysgu o hynny, ond gallem ni arwain mewn lot o lefydd hefyd.

So, I think that IT is challenging, but it also can provide solutions as we move forward. This is an issue that arises in other nations where there is more than one language. It happens across the world. The same discussions are happening in Canada in terms of tweeting in both languages, and we can learn lessons from that, but we can lead in a number of circumstances too.

[243] **Lee Waters:** Grêt, diolch.

Lee Waters: Great, thanks.

[244] **Bethan Jenkins:** Sian Gwenllian.

[245] **Sian Gwenllian:** Jest ar y pwynt yna, rydw i'n meddwl mai'r pwynt penodol oedd: os ydy rhywun yn trydar yn uniongyrchol yn Saesneg, mae rhywun yn cael ateb uniongyrchol yn ôl yn Saesneg. Nid oes dim angen i'r ateb yna fod yn ddwyieithog o dan y safonau, oherwydd dewis iaith ydy o. Os ydw

Sian Gwenllian: Just on that point, I think the specific point was that, if somebody is tweeting directly in English, one has an answer directly back in English. There is no need for that answer to be bilingual under the standards, because it is a choice of language. If I choose to tweet Arriva a message saying, 'There is no buffet

i'n dewis trydar neges i Arriva yn dweud, 'Does dim *buffet* ar y trê'n', sy'n digwydd yn aml, rydw i'n cael ateb yn ôl yn dweud, 'Gwnawn ni edrych i mewn iddo fo'. Nid oes dim rhaid iddyn nhw ateb yn ôl yn y ddwy iaith, os ydy—. Mae o'n fater o ddewis iaith. Felly, nid yw hynny yn broblem, nid ydw i'n meddwl.

[246] **Mr Dafydd:** Y gofyniad ydy peidio â thrin Cymraeg yn llai ffafriol na Saesneg. Felly, os ydych chi'n trin y ddwy iaith yr un peth, fel rydych chi'n ei ddisgrifio yn fanna, mae hynny'n iawn. Ond rydw i'n meddwl eich bod chi'n hollol gywir i fod yn tynnu sylw at Twitter fel ffordd o ddarparu gwasanaeth rheng flaen rwan. Nid ydych chi'n gallu jest ei weld fel modd o hyrwyddo ac rwy'n meddwl ei bod yn briodol i'w ystyried fel y buasem ni'n ystyried gwasanaethau eraill rheng flaen pwysig drwy gyfryngau traddodiadol.

[247] Un peth fuaswn i'n ei ddweud ydy yn y gweithdai rydym ni wedi bod yn rhan ohonyn nhw, mae wedi bod yn wych gweld sefydliadau yn ffeindio ffyrdd arloesol o ddatrys problemau. Rwy'n meddwl am un corff, er enghraifft, a oedd wedi cael problem o ran sut roedden nhw'n darparu gwasanaeth *end-to-end* yn Gymraeg, a chael yr arbenigwyr i allu ymateb i ymholiad yn llawn yn Gymraeg. Beth maen nhw wedi wneud ydy edrych ar sut maen nhw yn gweithredu yn gyffredinol o ran eu polisi nhw o ran ymholiadau. Beth

on the train', which happens regularly, I have an answer back saying, 'We'll look into it'. There is no need for them to answer back in both languages, if—. It's a matter of language choice, so that is not a problem, I wouldn't think.

Mr Dafydd: The requirement is not to treat Welsh less favourably than English. So, if you treat both languages the same, as you've described there, that's fine. I think you're quite correct to draw attention to Twitter as a means of providing a front-line service. You can't just see it as a way of promoting and I think it's appropriate to consider it as we'd consider other important front-line services that are provided in a traditional manner.

One thing I would say is that in the workshops we've been part of, it has been great to see organisations finding innovative ways of solving problems. I'm thinking of one organisation, for example, that had a problem in terms of how they were providing an end-to-end service through the medium of Welsh, and getting experts to respond to inquiries in full through the medium of Welsh. What they've done is look at how they operate generally in terms of their inquiry policy, and what they do is train the people who

maen nhw yn ei wneud ydy hyfforddi y bobl sy'n derbyn yr alwad yn y lle cyntaf yn y ganolfan alwadau neu yn y dderbynfa fel eu bod nhw yn gallu ymateb, erbyn hyn, i 70 y cant o ymholiadau ar y cyswllt cyntaf. Nid yw hynny jest yn eu galluogi nhw i gydymffurfio; mae o yn cynnig gwerth am arian ac mae'n wasanaeth gwell i'r cwsmer.

receive the call in the first place in the call centre or in the reception, so that they can now respond to 70 per cent of calls at that first initial contact. It doesn't just enable them to comply; it provides value for money and provides a better service for the customer.

[248] **Bethan Jenkins:** Oherwydd ein bod wedi mynd dros amser, rydym yn mynd i gael y cwestiwn olaf gan Dawn Bowden heddiw. Diolch.

Bethan Jenkins: We've gone over time, and we're going to have a final question from Dawn Bowden today. Thank you.

[249] **Dawn Bowden:** Thank you, Chair. Actually, I think a lot of it you've already answered in terms of behavioural change, but I wanted to just focus on one particular aspect. You've talked about the really good work that's happening, cultural change is taking place in a lot of organisations, but what we do know as a matter of fact is there are still lots of organisations out there that are openly hostile to the language, and will do what they have to do legally, but that doesn't produce cultural change. So, what I'm interested in is what work you are doing with those, because you must know who they are as well as I do. So, what work are you doing specifically with those very hostile organisations to shift that culture?

[250] **Ms Price:** Rydym wedi dewis amryfal dechnegau. Mi fuaswn i'n dweud, yn gyntaf, fel datganiad pendant o ran rheoleiddio, rydym ni eisiau cael traw effaith—cynnydd yn y defnydd, hybu'r Gymraeg—ac felly mae bob peth rydym ni yn ei wneud rydym yn ei wneud er mwyn cyflawni'r nod, nid er mwyn tic yn y bocs cydymffurfiaeth. Mae gennym ni amcanion eang. Felly, yn sicr, rydym ni yn mynd i drafod efo sefydliadau. Rydym yn cynnal y digwyddiadau yma i addysgu a chydweithio a datrys

Ms Price: We use a whole host of techniques. I would say, first of all, as a definitive statement in terms of regulation, we want to have an impact—an increase in usage, promoting the Welsh language—and therefore everything that we do we do in order to achieve that aim, rather than to put a tick in the compliance box. We have broad-ranging objectives. Therefore, certainly, we do discuss issues with organisations. We hold these events to educate, collaborate and find

problemau. Rydym yn gweithio efo defnyddwyr hefyd, ac rwy'n meddwl bod hyn yn rhan o'r ateb. Rydym yn mynd allan ac rydym yn eistedd lawr efo pobl i ddeall beth ydy'r trafferthion ansawdd, a thrafod efo sefydliadau a bwydo hyn yn ôl fel bod pobl yn meddwl am bwysigrwydd y gwaith a ddim yn ei weld o jest fel deddfwriaeth, ond eu bod nhw'n deall bod yna bobl yn rhan o'r darlun. Rydym yn trio cynorthwyo drwy dynnu llyfrgell arferion llwyddiannus, achos weithiau mae'r bobl yma sydd yn anfoddog mewn gwirionedd yn methu neu ddim yn siŵr sut i wneud pethau. Felly, drwy ein bod ni yn trio tynnu arferion llwyddiannus at ei gilydd i'w rhannu, mae hynny yn help.

resolutions to problems. We work also with service users, and I think that's part of the solution. We do get out there and we sit down with people to understand what the difficulties are in terms of quality of services, and then we discuss this with organisations and feed it back so that people do consider the importance of the work, and don't see it simply as a matter of legislative responsibility, but that they understand that there are people who underpin this. We try and provide assistance by drawing together an archive of good practice, because on occasion these people who are reluctant are unable or unsure how to do things. don't know how to provide these services. So, we do try and draw together an archive of good practice that can be shared, and that's of assistance.

[251] Mae'r broses orfodi yna, wrth gwrs. Rydym wedi gwneud ymchwiliadau, ond nid ydym wedi cosbi eto fel comisiynydd. Ac hyd yn oed mewn sefyllfaoedd lle rydym yn gosod camau, mae'r rheini yn rhai i adfer neu addysgu neu ddod â nhw i sefyllfa well. Roedd Meri yn sôn yn y cyfarfod cyntaf y bore yma am y gwersi nofio. Nid wyf yn dweud bod yna unrhyw drafferth efo sefydliadau o ran hynny, ond cynlluniau gweithredu rydym wedi eu gwneud. Rydym wedi mynd atyn nhw. Maen nhw'n paratoi'r cynlluniau. Mae'r trydydd sector wedi dod i mewn i drafod sut mae gwireddu'r

The enforcement process is in place, of course. We have carried out investigations, but as the commissioner we haven't penalised organisations as of yet. And even in situations where we do put steps in place, those are steps in order to restore, to educate or to put them in a better situation. Meri mentioned in your first session this morning swimming lessons. I'm not saying that there is any difficulty with organisations in that regard, but we've put in place action plans. We've approached them. They prepared these plans. We've brought the third sector in to discuss how we can

cynlluniau. Felly, mae'r arweiniad yn ofynnol, rwy'n meddwl, a'n bod ni yna yn gwneud gwaith efo nhw, ond, wrth gwrs, efo'r gorfodi mae'n rhaid iddyn nhw wneud y cynlluniau yna rwan. Felly, pe bai rhaid a lle mae yna, rydym yn defnyddio'r pwerau, ond i fod yn onest, rwyf wedi gweld newid o weld pethau yn ormod a sylweddoli ar ôl ychydig o amser fod yna ffordd o'u gwneud nhw, a'n bod ni yma yn y cyfnod gweithredol yn gweithio efo nhw. Rwy'n meddwl bod y broses o ddod a gosod a chyfnod herio, wel, proses yw e, ond unwaith mae'r diwrnodau gosod yn eu lle, maen nhw'n sylweddoli bod yna dîm yna i wneud gwaith efo nhw. A dros amser, mae'r berthynas yn cryfhau. Ond mae'n amhosibl i ni newid meddylfryd pawb. Mae yna rai sefydliadau sydd yn mynd i fod yn fwy heriol nag eraill, ac rydym ni'n treulio mwy o amser ac yn cymryd mwy o ddiddordeb i drïo newid y rheini dros amser.

deliver those action plans. So, I think leadership is key, and that we are there working with them, but in terms of enforcement they do have to implement those action plans. Therefore, if necessary, we do use the powers that we have to achieve that, but to be honest, I have seen a change from seeing things as being burdensome and then, over a period of time, people realising that there is a way of delivering these, and that we in this operational period can work with them to do that. I think the process of imposing standards and that period of challenge, well, it is a process, but once the standards have been imposed then they realise that there is a team there to work with them. And over time, that relationship strengthens. But it's impossible for us to change everyone's mindset. There are some organisations that will be more challenging than others, and we spend more time and take more of an interest in trying to change those over a period of time.

11:30

[252] **Ms Huws:** Rydym ni'n gweithredu ar sawl lefel. Rwy'n credu hefyd fod gan gomisiynydd rôl; os oes yna benaethiaid sydd yn ei ffeindio'n heriol neu'n llwyr wrthwynebus, rwy'n meddwl bod cyfrifoldeb arnaf i i gynnal sgwrs a thrafodaeth barhaol gyda nhw. Rwy'n credu bod hynny—nid wyf yn honni bod hynny'n gweithio drwy'r adeg,

Ms Huws: We operate at a number of levels. I do think as well that a commissioner has a role; if there are chief officials finding it challenging or are totally hostile, I think there's a responsibility for me to hold a continuing conversation and discussion with them. I don't claim that that works all the time, but I think that engaging, discussing and

ond rwy'n credu bod ymwneud a talking are vital.
siarad a thrafod yn hollbwysig.

[253] **Bethan Jenkins:** Dyna'r cyfnod o amser sydd gyda ni am heddiw. Diolch yn fawr iawn am eich tystiolaeth. Rwy'n siŵr y byddwn ni'n cymryd tystiolaeth gennych chi eto yn y dyfodol, ond diolch yn fawr iawn am ddod i mewn atom ni heddiw.

Bethan Jenkins: Okay, that's our time up for today. Thank you very much for your evidence. I'm sure we will be taking evidence from you again in the future, but thank you for joining us today.

[254] **Ms Huws:** Diolch yn fawr.

Ms Huws: Thank you very much.

Papurau i'w Nodi Papers to Note

[255] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rydym ni'n symud ymlaen at eitem 4—papurau i'w nodi. Mae llythyr gan yr Adran dros Faterion Digidol, Diwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon. Beth hoffwn i ddweud i gychwyn yw ein bod ni wedi cael llythyr ychwanegol gan Simon Curtis o Equity ar yr un pwnc. Roeddwn i eisiau gofyn i Aelodau a fyddai'n iawn i fi ysgrifennu at Euryng Ogwen Williams i drosglwyddo barn Simon Curtis. Mae'r llythyr yn glir nad yw Equity yn teimlo fel eu bod nhw wedi derbyn hysbysiadau ynglŷn â'r adolygiad o S4C, ac nad ydyn nhw wedi cael cyswllt gan y tîm adolygu, ac nad ydyn nhw'n gwybod at bwy i ddanfôn y wybodaeth. Felly, rwy'n credu bod hynny'n weddol ddifrifol. A oes gan Aelodau unrhyw sylwadau ychwanegol? A ydyn nhw'n hapus i fi wneud hynny? Grêt, diolch yn fawr iawn.

Bethan Jenkins: We move on now to item 4—papers to note. There's a letter from the Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport. My initial comments on this is that we've received an additional letter from Simon Curtis from Equity on the same topic. I wanted to ask Members if it would be okay for me to write to Euryng Ogwen Williams to convey the views of Simon Curtis. The letter is clear that Equity don't feel that they have received notifications on the review of S4C, and they haven't been contacted by the review team, and they don't know who to send information to. So, I do think that's quite a grave issue. Do Members have any further comments? Are they happy for me to do that? Excellent, thank you.

**Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd
o'r Cyfarfod**

**Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public
from the Meeting**

Cynnig:

Motion:

*bod y pwyllgor yn penderfynu that the committee resolves to
gwahardd y cyhoedd o weddill y exclude the public from the
cyfarfod yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog remainder of the meeting in
17.42(vi).*

*accordance with Standing Order
17.42(vi).*

Cynigiwyd y cynnig.

Motion moved.

[256] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rydym ni'n **Bethan Jenkins:** We move on to item
symud ymlaen at eitem 5—cynnig o 5—a motion under Standing Order
dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i wahardd y 17.42 to resolve to exclude the
cyhoedd o weddill y cyfarfod. Hapus? public from the remainder of the
meeting. Happy?

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion agreed.

Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 11:32.

The public part of the meeting ended at 11:32.